

JOHN H. ALLGAIR, PE, PP, LS (1983-2001)
DAVID J. SAMUEL, PE, PP, CME
JOHN J. STEFANI, PE, LS, PP, CME
JAY B. CORNELL, PE, PP, CME
MICHAEL J. McCLELLAND, PE, PP, CME
GREGORY R. VALES, PE, PP, CME



BRUCE M. KOCH, PE, PP, CME
LOUIS J. PLOSKONKA, PE, CME
TREVOR J. TAYLOR, PE, PP, CME
BEHRAM TURAN, PE, LSRP
LAURA J. NEUMANN, PE, PP
DOUGLAS ROHMEYER, PE, CFM, CME
ROBERT J. RUSSO, PE, PP, CME
JOHN J. HESS, PE, PP, CME
KEITH CHIARAVALLO, PE, CME

MEMORANDUM

**To: Chairman and Members of the
West Orange Planning Board**

**From: John J. Hess, PE, PP, CME
Planning Board Engineer**

Date: November 28, 2023

**Re: Application No. PB 23-09
Essex County Country Club
Amended Site Plan - Review #2
350 Mt. Pleasant Avenue
Block 156, Lot 1
Our File: VWRP0156.01**

**CC: Paul Grygiel, AICP, PP - Township Planning Director
Leonard Lepore, PE - Township Engineer
Diana McGovern, Esq. - Planning Board Attorney
Essex County Country Club - Applicant
Lisa A. John-Basta, Esq. - Applicant's Attorney
Paul T. Calabrese, PE - Applicant's Engineer
Frank J. Rawding, RA - Applicant's Architect**

Our office has received for review the following documents which were submitted in support of the above referenced application for Minor Site Plan approval for the above referenced property:

- A set of Site Plan drawings (18 sheets) prepared by Paul T. Calabrese, PE with Watermen, LLC of Allenwood, New Jersey and bearing a latest revision date of November 10, 2023.
- A set of Soil Erosion & Sediment Control Plans (2 sheets) prepared by Paul T. Calabrese, PE and bearing a latest revision date of September 9, 2023.
- A set of unsigned and undated Golf Course Plans (3 sheets) prepared by Hanse Golf Course Design, Inc. of Malvern, Pennsylvania.
- A Construction Detail Packet (11 sheets) prepared by Hanse Golf Course Design, Inc., undated.
- A print of a Survey of East Course, Essex County Country Club prepared by Charles Stewart, PLS with Stewart Associates Inc. of Roseland, New Jersey dated October 27, 1978.
- A Stormwater Management Report prepared by Paul Calabrese, PE and bearing a latest revision date of November 10, 2023.
- A document entitled "Essex County Country Club Soil Moving Permit Request, 350 Mount Pleasant Avenue, Block 156, Lot 1", undated.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Essex County Country Club. (PB 23-09)
Amended Site Plan - Review #2

November 28, 2023
Our File No. VWRP0156.01
Page 2

- A List of Owners within 200 Feet of Block 156, Lot 1 from the Office of the West Orange Tax Assessor dated September 27, 2023.
- A copy of a September 19, 2023 letter from the Hudson-Essex-Passaic Soil Conservation District which certifies the soil erosion and sediment control plan for the Essex County Golf Course Regrading (HEPSCD Ch.251 ID# 223-E-6919).
- A copy of an October 4, 2023 letter from the Hudson-Essex-Passaic Soil Conservation District which certifies the soil erosion and sediment control plan for the ECCC Golf Card Garage, Comfort Station & Parking (HEPSCD Ch.251 ID# 223-E-6952).
- A copy of a NJDEP Authorization to Discharge 5G3 – Construction Activity Stormwater (GP) dated September 20, 2023.
- A copy of a NJDEP Authorization to Discharge 5G3 – Construction Activity Stormwater (GP) dated October 17, 2023.
- A copy of an October 27, 2023 letter from David Moore with MTS Services, Inc. of Short Hills, New Jersey to the Township Forrester which states that the 24 trees removed by the Applicant were dead or dying Ash trees which had significant limb degeneration creating a safety hazard.
- A November 10, 2023 letter from Paul Calabrese, PE to the West Orange Planning Board which addresses the comments in our October 16, 2023 review memorandum.
- A November 14, 2023 letter from Lisa A. John-Basta, Esq. with Chiesa Shahinian & Giantomasi PC of Roseland, New Jersey to the West Orange Planning Board which transmitted supplemental information in support of this referenced application and requested that the application be amended to include a soil removal permit.

In addition to the above, our office previously received the following information as part of the original submission for this application:

- A set of architectural plans of the Proposed Comfort Station (2 sheets) prepared by Frank J. Rawding, RA of Morristown, New Jersey dated July 15, 2023.
- A set of architectural plans of the Proposed Cart Barn (2 sheets) prepared by Frank J. Rawding, RA of Morristown, New Jersey dated July 15, 2023.
- A completed Application Form dated August 21, 2023.
- A completed Application for Tree Removal and Replacement Permit dated August 23, 2023.
- A completed Site Plan/Subdivision Checklist.
- A completed Sustainability Checklist Form.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Essex County Country Club. (PB 23-09)
Amended Site Plan - Review #2

November 28, 2023
Our File No. VWRP0156.01
Page 3

- A list of the waivers requested by the Applicant.
- A Verification of Taxes & Sewer Charges Paid from the Office of the Tax Collector dated August 10 2023 which states that the taxes are paid until October 31, 2023 and the 2023 sewer charges are paid in full.
- Copies of the following prior Planning Board Resolutions of Approval for the property in question:
 - Planning Board Case No. PB-78-42 dated September 6, 1978.
 - Planning Board Case No. PB-79-36 dated November 28, 1979.
 - Planning Board Case No. PB-93-35 dated March 23, 1994.
 - Planning Board Case No. PB-96-27 dated February 5, 1997.
 - Planning Board Case No. PB-00-19 dated February 15, 2001.
 - Planning Board Case No. PB-02-10 dated November 13, 2002.
 - Planning Board Case No. PB-03-18 (SRP) dated January 7, 2004.
 - Planning Board Case No. PB-14-04 dated July 2, 2014.

We have reviewed the information submitted in support of this application and offer the following comments:

A. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The property in question is an irregularly shaped tract which is bounded by Mt. Pleasant Avenue to the north, Prospect Avenue to the east, Old Indian Road to the south and the Francis A. Byrne Golf Course to the west. It is located in the R-2 Single Family Residential Zone and has an area of 176.832 acres. The property is currently occupied by the Essex County Country Club which includes an 18 hole golf course, a driving range, a practice green, a club house, a pool house, two (2) inground pools, tennis courts, a golf cart barn/pro shop, several maintenance buildings and several parking areas.

The Applicant is seeking Amended Site Plan approval to permit demolition of the golf cart barn/pro shop and the construction of a cart barn near the northwest corner of the site, a comfort station building along the southerly side of the site, widening of the driveway entrance, improvements to the parking lots, installation of new lighting along the entrance drive and parking lots, a new tee box for the 1st hole and regrading/reshaping of various areas throughout the existing golf course. The Applicant is also seeking a tree removal permit and a soil removal permit as part of this application. The proposed parking lot improvements will result in the addition of 33 parking spaces at the site for a total of 236 parking spaces whereas 658 parking spaces are required. In addition, the Applicant proposes to install conduits for 10 future electric vehicle charging stations.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Essex County Country Club. (PB 23-09)
Amended Site Plan - Review #2

November 28, 2023
Our File No. VWRP0156.01
Page 4

B. DESIGN COMMENTS

1. Based on our review, we find that the following items from the Township's Site Plan/Subdivision Checklist must be addressed:
 - a) Item #14 – *Affidavit of ownership*. In his November 10, 2023 letter, Mr. Calabrese states that an affidavit of ownership is only required by the Map Filing Law for minor and major subdivision. However, the Site Plan/Subdivision Checklist shows that an affidavit of ownership must be submitted for site plan applications.
2. The Applicant has requested the following waivers:
 - a) Item #13 – *Metes and bounds description showing dimensions, bearings, curve data, length of tangents, radii, arcs, chords and central angles for all centerlines and right-of-way, and centerline curves on streets.*
 - b) Item # 19 – *All proposed lot lines and area of lots in square feet.*
 - c) Item #28 – *All existing street, water courses, flood plains, wetlands or other environmentally sensitive areas on and within 200' of site.*
 - d) Item #29 – *Existing right-of-way and/or easements on and within 200' of tract.*
 - e) Item #32 – *Boundary, limits, nature and extent of wooded areas, specimen trees, and other significant physical features.*
 - f) Item #45 – *Landscape plan & details prepared by a professional landscape architect.*
 - g) Item #46 – *Solid waste management plan.*
 - h) Item #52 – *Plans and legal documents for compliance with West Orange COAH Ordinances.*
 - i) To permit the submission of a boundary survey which is more than 5 years old.
 - j) From the requirement to submit a tree expert's report.
3. In his October 27, 2023 letter, Mr. David Moore with MTS Services, Inc. states that the Applicant removed 24 dead or dying Ash trees at the site. Our office performed a site visit on October 30, 2023 with the Township Forrester at which time it was determined that 15 of the trees that were removed were located within 75 ft of the Mt. Pleasant Avenue property line while the remaining 9 trees were located further than 75 ft from a property line. The Tree Removal Ordinance stipulates that tree removal on a golf course which is greater than 75 ft from a property line is exempt from the permit requirements of the ordinance. Therefore, the Applicant requires, and has requested, a tree removal permit for the 15 trees that were removed within 75 ft of Mt. Pleasant Avenue.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Essex County Country Club. (PB 23-09)
Amended Site Plan - Review #2

November 28, 2023
Our File No. VWRP0156.01
Page 5

4. It shows on the Golf Course Plans that the Applicant proposes to regrade/reshape many areas throughout the golf course. The Applicant should address the Board regarding the reasons for the proposed changes. In addition, it shows on the Soil Erosion & Sediment Control Plans that the area of disturbance will be 20.16 acres. Chapter 30 of the Township Code stipulates that any person who moves soil in or upon 12,000 sf of land area in a district zoned for residential use requires a soil removal permit. The Applicant should address the Board regarding compliance with the soil removal permit standards set forth in Chapter 30 of the Township Code.
5. It shows on the plans that the Applicant proposes to install conduits for 10 future electric vehicle (EV) charging stations. As required by the Ordinance, at least 1 of the EV parking spaces shall be accessible for persons with disabilities.
6. It remains for sheet 4 to be revised to dimension the width and depth of the proposed parking spaces.
7. It shows on sheet 4 that the pavement entrance will be reconstructed using a 4" HMA 12.5M64 Binder Course over 6" Compacted DGA whereas the HMA Pavement Section Full Depth on sheet 16 shows the 2" HMA 12.5M64 Surface Course over 4" HMA 12.5M64 Binder Course over 6" Compacted DGA. This discrepancy must be resolved.
8. Sheet 5 shows that the proposed Comfort Station will be set back 58 ft from the southerly property line. In addition, it will be located approximately 145 ft from the nearest existing residential dwelling. The Applicant should address the Board regarding how this location was selected and the anticipated impacts, if any, on the existing residential neighborhood to the south. The Applicant may wish to consider relocating the Comfort Station further from the existing residential dwellings.
9. It shows on sheet 7 that the stair risers adjacent to the driveway will be 6.5" high whereas Note #5 on the Concrete Stair Detail on sheet 17 states that the risers will be 7" high. This discrepancy must be resolved..
10. The Concrete Stair Detail on sheet 17 includes a callout which states "*Tread Dims. as per Site Plan*". However, the Site Plan drawings do not specify the tread dimension. This discrepancy must be addressed.
11. Note #2 on the Concrete Stair Detail on sheet 17 states "*For stair dimension see site plan*". However, no dimensions are shown on the site plan, This discrepancy must be resolved.
12. Note #4 on the Concrete Stair Detail on sheet 17 states that "*All stairs shall have hand rails (both sides)*". Therefore, a hand rail detail must be added to the plans.
13. Note #6 on the Concrete Stair Detail on sheet 17 states that "*All stairs shall have a curb wall on both sides*". Therefore, a curb wall detail must be added to the plans.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Essex County Country Club. (PB 23-09)
Amended Site Plan - Review #2

November 28, 2023
Our File No. VWRP0156.01
Page 6

14. The Cart Barn architectural plans show proposed recycling filtration equipment within the building. The Applicant should address the Board regarding the purpose of the recycling filtration equipment.

C. LANDSCAPING AND LIGHTING

1. The Landscaping Plan (sheet 14) shows only one symbol for 3 different types of plantings that are proposed. For the purpose of clarity, separate symbols must be used for each type of planting..
2. In accordance with Section 25-14.1e., provision shall be made for the reduction in the intensity of illumination to the minimum needed for security purposes when the facility is not in operation; whereas timers and hours of operation have not been indicated. In his November 10, 2023 letter, Mr. Calabrese states that the *"Current system is on photocell only and site is far from boundaries"*.
3. Provide the manufacturer's catalog cuts for all fixtures and poles. Include the isolux pattern details with a scale and graph. Additionally, provide the ordering information for the proposed light poles. In his November 10, 2023 letter, Mr. Calabrese states that manufacturer's catalog cuts for fixtures and poles are enclosed; however, this information was not received by our office.

D. DRAINAGE

1. It shows on the plans that the area of disturbance will be greater than 2 acres. As a result, the project is classified as a Major Development which requires that the project be designed to meet the stormwater runoff quality, quantity and groundwater recharge standards using green infrastructure.
2. No soil investigation/analysis has been performed to determine the conditions of the soils on site in accordance with Chapter 12 of the current NJ Stormwater Best Management Practices (NJBMP) Manual. Accordingly, compliance with the applicable State and Township stormwater management requirements cannot be confirmed and it is unclear whether the proposed stormwater management system will function consistent with the analysis in the stormwater management report. At a minimum, the following soil investigations are required:
 - a. A minimum of two (2) soil profile test pits must be excavated within the infiltration area of any proposed infiltration BMP to determine the suitability and distribution of soil types and seasonal high-water table present at the location of the BMP.
 - b. At least one (1) test to establish the soil hydraulic conductivity must be conducted for each soil profile pit / boring.
 - c. All soil profile test pits and/or soil borings performed for the purpose of designing an infiltration BMP must extend to a minimum of eight (8) below the lowest elevation of the BMP.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Essex County Country Club. (PB 23-09)
Amended Site Plan - Review #2

November 28, 2023
Our File No. VWRP0156.01
Page 7

In his November 10, 2023 letter, Mr. Calabrese states *"Soil investigation/analysis for all proposed BMPs will be completed and provided"*.

3. The Annual Groundwater Recharge Analysis worksheets for the Comfort Station Bioretention Station includes several error messages (#DIV/0!). The causes of the error messages must be determined and resolved.
4. In accordance with Section 25-29.4.l, if there is more than one drainage area, the groundwater recharge, stormwater runoff quality, and stormwater runoff quantity standards shall be met in each drainage area. As noted below, it appears that the runoff quantity standards are not met for PDA-2 and PDA-3.
5. In accordance with Section 25-29.4.q.2, to comply with the stormwater quality standards, an 80% total suspended solid (TSS) removal rate must be provided when a major development proposes a net increase of 0.25 acres or more of regulated motor vehicle surface. The stormwater management report indicates that there will be less than 0.25 acres increase in motor vehicle surface and that the stormwater quality requirements are not applicable to this development. Testimony should be provided to confirm same and it remains for detailed calculations to be provided to verify the increase in motor vehicle surface area.
6. The Infiltration Basin System Components detail on sheet 17 must be revised to show that filter fabric will be installed on the sides of the basin only as stipulated in the NJ BMP Manual.
7. The Parking Island Sump/Bio-Retention Detail on sheet 17 must be revised to show that filter fabric will be installed on the sides of the basin only as stipulated in the NJ BMP Manual.
8. The Outlet Structure detail on sheet 17 includes a callout for a trash rack. Therefore, a trash rack detail must be added to the plans.
9. As stipulated in Section 25-29.10 of the Land Use Regulations, it remains for the design engineer to prepare a maintenance plan for the stormwater management measures incorporated into the design of a major development. In addition, the maintenance plan and any future revisions shall be recorded upon the deed of record for each property on which the maintenance described in the maintenance plan must be undertaken. Prior to recording, the form of the deed must be approved by the Planning Board Attorney and our office.

The Applicant is hereby advised that any revised plans or other documents submitted to the Board should be accompanied by a cover letter which addresses each of the comments in this review letter and also details any other changes that have been made to the plans as these may not be readily apparent.