

JOHN H. ALLGAIR, PE, PP, LS (1983-2001)
DAVID J. SAMUEL, PE, PP, CME
JOHN J. STEFANI, PE, LS, PP, CME
JAY B. CORNELL, PE, PP, CME
MICHAEL J. McCLELLAND, PE, PP, CME
GREGORY R. VALES, PE, PP, CME



BRUCE M. KOCH, PE, PP, CME
LOUIS J. PLOSKONKA, PE, CME
TREVOR J. TAYLOR, PE, PP, CME
BEHRAM TURAN, PE, LSRP
LAURA J. NEUMANN, PE, PP
DOUGLAS ROHMEYER, PE, CFM, CME
ROBERT J. RUSSO, PE, PP, CME
JOHN J. HESS, PE, PP, CME
KEITH CHIARAVALLA, PE, CME

MEMORANDUM

To: *Chairman and Members of the
West Orange Planning Board*

From: *John J. Hess, PE, PP, CME
Planning Board Engineer*

Date: *March 11, 2024*

Re: *Application No. PB 24-04
Montclair Golf Club
Half-Way House, Golf Building
Addition & Parking Lot Improvements
Review #1
Preliminary & Final Site Plan with "C" Variances
25 Prospect Avenue
Block 151, Lot 1
Our File: VWRP0151.01 (60003)*

CC: *Geniece Gary-Adams – Zoning Official
Zayibeth Carballo, PE, PLS, PP, CME, CFM, CFS – Ass't Municipal Engineer
Paul Grygiel, AICP, PP - Township Planner
Diana McGovern, Esq. – Planning Board Attorney
Montclair Golf Club - Applicant
Alan G. Trembulak, Esq. – Applicant's Attorney
Michael J. Fowler, PE – Applicant's Engineer
Frank J. Rawding, RA – Applicant's Architect
David R. Avery, PLS – Applicant's Surveyor*

Our office has received for review the following documents which were submitted in support of the above referenced application for Preliminary and Final Major Site Plan approval with "C" Variances and Tree Removal Permit approval:

- A set of Preliminary & Final Site Plan drawings (26 sheets) prepared by Michael J. Fowler, PE, David R. Avery, PLS and Michael Szura, CLA with Langan Engineering and Environmental Services, Inc., of Parsippany, New Jersey and bearing a latest issue date of January 17, 2024.
- A set of unsigned architectural plans for the proposed Half-Way House (2 sheets) prepared by Frank J. Rawding, RA with F. J. Rawding, A.I.A. dated January 16, 2024.
- A set of unsigned architectural plans for the proposed Pro Shop Renovation (3 sheets) prepared by Frank J. Rawding, RA with F. J. Rawding, A.I.A. dated January 16, 2024.
- A Stormwater Management Report prepared by Michael Fowler, PE dated January 17, 2024.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Montclair Golf Club (PB 24-04)
Irrigation Reservoir Expansion
Preliminary & Final Site Plan with "C" Variances - Review #1

March 11, 2024
Our File No. VWRP0151.01
Page 2

- A Stormwater Maintenance Plan prepared by Michael Fowler, PE dated January 17, 2024.
- A completed Application Form dated January 13, 2024.
- A copy of a Proposal prepared by the Montclair Real Estate Law Group of Montclair, New Jersey dated January 10, 2024 which describes the application proposed by the Montclair Golf Club, sets forth the variance relief requested by the Applicant and sets forth the reasons why the variance relief should be granted.
- A completed Site Plan/Subdivision Checklist.
- A completed Sustainability Checklist Form.
- A Verification of Taxes & Sewer Charges Paid from the Office of the West Orange Tax Collector dated January 16, 2024 for Block 151, Lot 1 which states that the taxes are paid until the 4th Quarter of 2023 and the 2023 sewer charges are paid in full.
- A List of Owners within 200 Feet of Block 151, Lots 1 & 49 from the Office of the Township of West Orange Assessor dated January 10, 2024.
- A List of Owners within 200 Feet of Block 601, Lot 1 from the Office of the Township of Verona Assessor dated January 9, 2024.
- Copies of prior Planning Board & Zoning Board Resolutions of Approval for the property in question (Resolutions PB-88-01, PB-88-33, ZB-91-24, PB-93-14, PB-96-19, PB-97-22, PB-02-06, PB-04-16, PB-11-02T, PB-11-16, PB-19-11, PB-21-06 and PB-22-11).

We have reviewed the information submitted in support of this application and offer the following comments:

A. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The property in question, which comprises the Montclair Golf Club, is an irregularly shaped tract which fronts on the westerly side of Prospect Avenue approximately 4,500 ft north of the intersection with Eagle Rock Avenue. It also fronts on the easterly side of Pleasant Valley Way. The Montclair Golf Club is located in both the Township of West Orange and the Township of Verona and the total area of the tract is approximately 277 acres. Within the Township of West Orange, it is located in the R-2 Single Family Residential Zone and has an area of approximately 189 acres. The existing clubhouse, a golf building and a portion of the golf course are located within the Township of West Orange.

The Applicant is seeking Preliminary & Final Site Plan approval with "C" variance relief to permit the following improvements at the site:

1. The construction of a new half-way house with covered sitting areas, an open outdoor sitting area and a fire pit with perimeter seating.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Montclair Golf Club (PB 24-04)
Irrigation Reservoir Expansion
Preliminary & Final Site Plan with "C" Variances - Review #1

March 11, 2024
Our File No. VWRP0151.01
Page 3

- The construction of an addition to the existing golf building.
- The construction of a new golf cart staging area with golf cart parking spaces in front of the halfway house.
- The construction of a new golf cart driveway behind the golf building.
- The construction of new paver walkways.
- The construction of a new parking lot for 15 vehicles in front of the clubhouse.
- The construction of modifications to the existing entrance drives from Prospect Avenue and the circulation drive adjacent to the caddyshack building.

B. DESIGN COMMENTS

1. Based on our review, we find that the following items from the Township's Site Plan/Subdivision Checklist must be addressed:
 - a) Item #14 – *Affidavit of ownership.*
 - b) Item #20 – *Copy and/or delineation of any existing or proposed deed restrictions or covenants.*
 - c) Item #23 – *List of required regulatory approvals or permits.*
 - d) Item #25 – *Requested or obtained design waivers or exceptions.*
 - e) Item #46 – *Solid waste management plan.*
 - f) Item #48 – *Sight triangles.*
 - g) Item #52 – *Plans and legal documents for compliance with West Orange COAH Ordinances.*
2. The Applicant has not requested any submission waivers.
3. It states on the Application Form that the property being developed is Block 151, Lot 1 in the Township of West Orange. However, it states on the plans that the property being developed is Block 151, Lot 1 in the Township of West Orange and Block 601, Lot 1 in the Township of Verona. In addition, the Lists of Property Owners within 200 Ft include Block 151, Lots 1 & 49 in the Township of West Orange and Block 601, Lot 1 in the Township of Verona. These discrepancies must be resolved.
4. It states on sheet CS001 of the site plan drawings that the project attorney is Gaccione & Pomaco, PC of Belleville, New Jersey whereas it states on the Application Form that the project attorney is Alan G. Trembulak, Esq. with the Montclair Real Estate Law Group of Montclair, New Jersey. This discrepancy must be resolved.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Montclair Golf Club (PB 24-04)
Irrigation Reservoir Expansion
Preliminary & Final Site Plan with "C" Variances - Review #1

March 11, 2024
Our File No. VWRP0151.01
Page 4

5. It states on the Site Statistics table on sheet CS101 that 387 parking spaces are proposed at the site. Therefore, the Applicant should submit to the Board a plan which shows all of the parking spaces at the site.
6. As stipulated in the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) Standards, parking lots having between 301 to 400 parking spaces require a minimum of 8 handicap accessible parking spaces. The plans must be revised to demonstrate that the required number of handicap accessible parking spaces have been provided.
7. The Applicant should address the Board regarding their plans to provide make-ready electric vehicle parking spaces at the site. We note that Section 25-12.6 of the Land Use Regulations requires the installation of make-ready parking spaces for each application involving a parking lot which requires preliminary site plan approval.
8. It shows on sheet CS102 that the 20 ft wide drive aisle in front of the golf cart staging area will be one way only. A do not enter sign should be provided at the southerly end of this drive aisle.
9. Sheets CS101 and CS103 should be revised to provide a stop sign adjacent to the stop bar at the southerly end of the new row of 15 parking spaces in front of the clubhouse.
10. The Applicant should address the Board regarding their plans to provide a 5 ft wide sidewalk from the new 15 parking spaces to the clubhouse as required by §25-12.1.a of the Land Use Regulations.
11. Sheet CS-103 shows that the southerly entrance from Prospect Avenue will be modified to have a full movement lane entering the site and separate right turn and left turn lanes exiting the site. It appears that there will be room for only 1 vehicle in each lane exiting the site. Our office is concerned that vehicles waiting the exit the site may block some of the circulation drives. The Applicant should address the Board regarding the need to revise the parking layout in order to provide additional stacking for exiting vehicles.
12. Sheet CG-101 should be revised to show the proposed finished floor elevations for the Golf Building and the Half-Way House.
13. Sheet CG103 must be revised to show the pipe length, pipe size, type of pipe and pipe slope from CB-101 to the cleanout.
14. Sheet CG-103 must be revised to show the pipe length, pipe size, type of pipe and pipe slope for the roof drain pipe from the clubhouse to the porous asphalt basin.
15. Sheet CU102 must be revised to show the invert elevation of the sewer lateral at the rear of the golf building.
16. Sheet CS503 includes a 3' High Metal Fence detail. Therefore, the plans must be revised to identify where this fence is proposed.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Montclair Golf Club (PB 24-04)
Irrigation Reservoir Expansion
Preliminary & Final Site Plan with "C" Variances - Review #1

March 11, 2024
Our File No. VWRP0151.01
Page 5

17. The Applicant should submit calculations to demonstrate that the existing 6" sewer service has adequate capacity to accommodate the additional flows that are proposed.
18. The plans must be revised to include bedding and trench restoration details for the water, sanitary sewer and drainage pipes.
19. The Applicant should address the Board regarding whether any trees are proposed to be removed and the need to obtain a tree removal permit.

C. DRAINAGE COMMENTS

1. The proposed development will result in the disturbance of more than one acre. As a result, it is classified as a Major Development which requires that the project be designed to meet the stormwater runoff quality, quantity and groundwater recharge standards using green infrastructure..
2. The rainfall rates utilized for the stormwater management hydrographs do not match the NOAA 24-Hr Rainfall depths provided in the body and appendix of the Stormwater Management Report. Please revise for consistency.
3. To demonstrate compliance with the Water Quality requirements set forth by NJAC 7:8, provide a calculation of the total existing and proposed motor vehicle surface coverage on-site. Figures 9 and 10 as provided within the appendix of the Stormwater Management Report appear to only quantify existing and proposed impervious cover.
4. The Stormwater Management Report should be revised to include hydrographs of the water quality storm event.
5. The Stormwater Management Report should be revised to include storm sewer pipe size calculations to confirm proposed pipe sizes will be adequately sized for proposed flows. Calculations should be provided using, at a minimum, the 25-year design storm.
6. Soil testing must be provided in accordance with Chapter 12 of the New Jersey Stormwater Best Management Practices (BMP) Manual to verify the seasonal high-water table elevation and design permeability rates for each BMP that is proposing infiltration.
7. Additional information including topography, land cover, length of flow path, and slope of flow path must be provided on the Existing and Proposed Watershed Area Maps to verify the time of concentration calculations.
8. Separate time of concentration calculations are needed for pervious and impervious areas. Revise existing and proposed time of concentration calculations accordingly.
9. Revise Grading & Drainage Plan II to indicate the location of the Porous Pavement System Outlet Control Structure.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Montclair Golf Club (PB 24-04)
Irrigation Reservoir Expansion
Preliminary & Final Site Plan with "C" Variances - Review #1

March 11, 2024
Our File No. VWRP0151.01
Page 6

10. Revise Stormwater Management Report to show compliance with the contributory drainage area requirement for the Porous Pavement System in accordance with Chapter 9.6 of the New Jersey Stormwater Best Management Practices (BMP) Manual.
11. Per Chapter 9.6 of the New Jersey Stormwater Best Management Practices (BMP) Manual, at least one inspection port, with a removable cap, must be provided in the storage bed. Revise Grading & Drainage Plan II to include inspection port locations within the pervious paving system. Further, revise the Typical Porous Pavement Cross Section Detail to show an inspection port(s).
12. Per Chapter 9.6 of the New Jersey Stormwater Best Management Practices (BMP) Manual, roof runoff that by-passes the surface course must be pretreated. Revise plans to demonstrate compliance.
13. Revise the Porous Pavement System Outlet Control Structure detail to indicate correct pipe sizes for inlet and outlet pipes.
14. Revise the Typical Porous Pavement Cross Section Detail to provide filter fabric along the sides of the system in accordance with Chapter 9.6 of the New Jersey Stormwater Best Management Practices (BMP) Manual.
15. Revise the Typical Porous Pavement Cross Section Detail to provide an inspection port(s) in accordance with Chapter 9.6 of the New Jersey Stormwater Best Management Practices (BMP) Manual.
16. Revise the Typical Porous Pavement Cross Section Detail to specify AASHTO No. 2 within the storage bed in accordance with Chapter 9.6 of the New Jersey Stormwater Best Management Practices (BMP) Manual.
17. Per Chapter 9.7 of the New Jersey Stormwater Best Management Practices (BMP) Manual, pretreatment must be provided for subsurface infiltration basins. Please revise accordingly.
18. Clarify if a weir is proposed within the underground infiltration basin's outlet control structure (OCS-201). The stormwater management analysis and outlet control structure detail are inconsistent.
19. The Stormwater Maintenance Manual must be revised to address the following items:
 - a) The plan must include cost estimates including the estimated cost of sediment, debris, or trash removal.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Montclair Golf Club (PB 24-04)
Irrigation Reservoir Expansion
Preliminary & Final Site Plan with "C" Variances - Review #1

March 11, 2024
Our File No. VWRP0151.01
Page 7

- b) The plan must be recorded upon the deed of record for each property on which the maintenance must be undertaken. Prior to recording, the form of the deed must be approved by the Planning Board Attorney.
- c) The plan must state that the responsible person shall maintain a detailed log of all preventative and corrective maintenance for the structural stormwater management measures incorporated into the design of the development, including a record of all inspections, and copies of all maintenance-related work orders.
- d) The plan must state that the responsible party shall evaluate the effectiveness of the maintenance plan at least once per year and adjust the plan and the deed as necessary.
- e) The plan must state that the responsible party shall retain and make available, upon request by any public entity with administrative, health, environmental, or safety authority over the site, the maintenance plan and the documentation required by §25-29.10b6 and b7 in the Ordinance.
- f) The plan must state that in the event the stormwater management facility becomes a danger to public safety or public health, or if it is in need of maintenance or repair, the municipality shall so notify the responsible person in writing. Upon receipt of that notice, the responsible person shall have 14 days to effect maintenance and repair of the facility in a manner that is approved by the municipal engineer or his designee. The municipality, in its discretion, may extend the time allowed for effecting maintenance and repair for good cause. If the responsible party fails or refuses to perform such maintenance and repair, then municipality or County may immediately proceed to do so and shall bill the cost thereof to the responsible person. Nonpayment of such bill may result in a lien on the property.

A. LANDSCAPING COMMENTS

1. It appears the Applicant is proposing to preserve existing trees in poor condition. Based on recent Google street view images, it appears the Ash tree by the fire hydrant along Prospect Avenue is in decline due to the Emerald ash borer. Further down the road, two (2) oak trees near the existing caddy shack building are dead and pose a high risk of failure. These three (3) trees should be indicated to be removed.
2. Revise the plans to provide an alternative to proposed EC (Burning bush) as this is a highly invasive species and should not be utilized. Also, provide an alternative for proposed AS (Sugar Maple) as this species does not tolerate road salt.
3. Revise the plant schedules to indicate multi-stem ornamental trees to be a minimum height. Currently, trees are indicated by caliper size only.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Montclair Golf Club (PB 24-04)
Irrigation Reservoir Expansion
Preliminary & Final Site Plan with "C" Variances - Review #1

March 11, 2024
Our File No. VWRP0151.01
Page 8

4. Revise the 'Deciduous Tree Planting' detail, sheet 25 of 25, to indicate rigid, plastic open mesh trunk guards to be provided to protect from the irreparable damage from buck rub. Provide a detail of same.
5. Revise the 'Construction Schedule', sheet 14 of 25, to indicate timing of tree protection fence installation and removal, to prevent confusion during construction.
6. Revise the plans to depict mulch bed lines on the plans, to prevent confusion during construction.

B. LIGHTING COMMENTS

1. In accordance with Section 25-14.1 e., provision shall be made for the reduction in the intensity of illumination to the minimum needed for security purposes when the facility is not in operation; whereas timers and hours of operation have not been indicated.
2. Revise the plans to indicate the proposed color and finish for all light fixtures and poles.
3. Revise the plans to provide isolux pattern details with a scale and graph.
4. Sheet LL102 includes a callout which states "*Refer to architectural drawings for canopy and egress lighting (Typ.)*." However, no lighting information is provided on the architectural drawings. This discrepancy must be resolved.

The Applicant is hereby advised that any revised plans or other documents submitted to the Board should be accompanied by a cover letter which addresses each of the comments in this review letter and also details any other changes that have been made to the plans as these may not be readily apparent.