

JOHN H. ALLGAIR, PE, PP, LS (1983-2001)
DAVID J. SAMUEL, PE, PP, CME
JOHN J. STEFANI, PE, LS, PP, CME
JAY B. CORNELL, PE, PP, CME
MICHAEL J. McCLELLAND, PE, PP, CME
GREGORY R. VALES, PE, PP, CME



BRUCE M. KOCH, PE, PP, CME
LOUIS J. PLOSKONKA, PE, CME
TREVOR J. TAYLOR, PE, PP, CME
BEHRAM TURAN, PE, LSRP
LAURA J. NEUMANN, PE, PP
DOUGLAS ROHMEYER, PE, CFM, CME
ROBERT J. RUSSO, PE, PP, CME
JOHN J. HESS, PE, PP, CME
KEITH CHIARAVALLO, PE, CME

MEMORANDUM

**To: Chairman and Members of the
West Orange Planning Board**

**From: John J. Hess, PE, PP, CME
Planning Board Engineer**

Date: June 4, 2024

**Re: Application No. PB 24-04
Montclair Golf Club
Half-Way House, Golf Building
Addition & Parking Lot Improvements
Preliminary & Final Site Plan with "C" Variances
Review #2
25 Prospect Avenue
Block 151, Lot 1
Our File: VWRP0151.01 (60003)**

**CC: Geniece Gary-Adams – Zoning Official
Zayibeth Carballo, PE, PLS, PP, CME, CFM, CFS – Ass't Municipal Engineer
George Wheatle Williams, PP – Planning Board Planner
Diana McGovern, Esq. – Planning Board Attorney
Montclair Golf Club - Applicant
Alan G. Trembulak, Esq. – Applicant's Attorney
Michael J. Fowler, PE – Applicant's Engineer
Frank J. Rawding, RA – Applicant's Architect
David R. Avery, PLS – Applicant's Surveyor**

Our office has received for review the following documents which were submitted in support of the above referenced application for Preliminary and Final Major Site Plan approval with "C" Variances and Tree Removal Permit approval:

- A set of Preliminary & Final Site Plan drawings (26 sheets) prepared by Michael J. Fowler, PE, David R. Avery, PLS and Michael Szura, CLA with Langan Engineering and Environmental Services, Inc. of Parsippany, New Jersey and bearing a latest revision date of May 3, 2024.
- A set of architectural plans for the proposed Half-Way House (2 sheets) prepared by Frank J. Rawding, RA with F. J. Rawding, A.I.A. dated May 3, 2024.
- A set of architectural plans for the proposed Pro Shop Renovation (2 sheets) prepared by Frank J. Rawding, RA with F. J. Rawding, A.I.A. dated May 3, 2024.
- A Stormwater Management Report prepared by Michael Fowler, PE and bearing a latest revision date of May 3, 2024.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Montclair Golf Club (PB 24-04)
Half-Way House, Golf Building Addition & Parking Lot Improvements
Preliminary & Final Site Plan with "C" Variances - Review #2

June 4, 2024
Our File No. VWRP0151.01
Page 2

- A set of Existing and Proposed Parking Count Figures (2 sheets) prepared by Langan Engineering and Environmental Services, Inc. dated May 3, 2024.
- A Stormwater Maintenance Plan prepared by Michael Fowler, PE and bearing a latest revision date of May 3, 2024.
- A letter from Timothy B. Derrick, PE with Langan Engineering and Environmental Services, Inc. to the West Orange Planning Board which addressed the comments in our March 11, 2024 review memorandum
- A memorandum from Timothy B. Derrick, PE and Michael Fowler, PE to the West Orange Planning Board which provides sanitary flow calculations for the proposed improvements.

In addition to the above, our office previously received the following information as part of the original submission for this application:

- A completed Application Form dated January 13, 2024.
- A copy of a Proposal prepared by the Montclair Real Estate Law Group of Montclair, New Jersey dated January 10, 2024 which describes the application proposed by the Montclair Golf Club, sets forth the variance relief requested by the Applicant and sets forth the reasons why the variance relief should be granted.
- A completed Site Plan/Subdivision Checklist.
- A completed Sustainability Checklist Form.
- A Verification of Taxes & Sewer Charges Paid from the Office of the West Orange Tax Collector dated January 16, 2024 for Block 151, Lot 1 which states that the taxes are paid until the 4th Quarter of 2023 and the 2023 sewer charges are paid in full.
- A List of Owners within 200 Feet of Block 151, Lots 1 & 49 from the Office of the Township of West Orange Assessor dated January 10, 2024.
- A List of Owners within 200 Feet of Block 601, Lot 1 from the Office of the Township of Verona Assessor dated January 9, 2024.
- Copies of prior Planning Board & Zoning Board Resolutions of Approval for the property in question (Resolutions PB-88-01, PB-88-33, ZB-91-24, PB-93-14, PB-96-19, PB-97-22, PB-02-06, PB-04-16, PB-11-02T, PB-11-16, PB-19-11, PB-21-06 and PB-22-11).

We have reviewed the information submitted in support of this application and offer the following comments:



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Montclair Golf Club (PB 24-04)
Half-Way House, Golf Building Addition & Parking Lot Improvements
Preliminary & Final Site Plan with "C" Variances - Review #2

June 4, 2024
Our File No. VWRP0151.01
Page 3

A. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The property in question, which comprises the Montclair Golf Club, is an irregularly shaped tract which fronts on the westerly side of Prospect Avenue approximately 4,500 ft north of the intersection with Eagle Rock Avenue. It also fronts on the easterly side of Pleasant Valley Way. The Montclair Golf Club is located in both the Township of West Orange and the Township of Verona and the total area of the tract is approximately 277 acres. Within the Township of West Orange, it is located in the R-2 Single Family Residential Zone and has an area of approximately 189 acres. The existing clubhouse, a golf building and a portion of the golf course are located within the Township of West Orange.

The Applicant is seeking Preliminary & Final Site Plan approval with "C" variance relief to permit the following improvements at the site:

- The construction of a new half-way house with covered sitting areas, an open outdoor sitting area and a fire pit with perimeter seating.
- The construction of an addition to the existing golf building.
- The construction of a new golf cart staging area with golf cart parking spaces in front of the halfway house.
- The construction of a new golf cart driveway behind the golf building.
- The construction of new paver walkways.
- The construction of a new parking lot for 15 vehicles in front of the clubhouse.
- The construction of modifications to the existing entrance drives from Prospect Avenue and the circulation drive adjacent to the caddyshack building.

B. DESIGN COMMENTS

1. Based on our review, we find that the following items from the Township's Site Plan/Subdivision Checklist must be addressed:
 - a) Item #14 – *Affidavit of ownership.*
 - b) Item #46 – *Solid waste management plan.*
 - c) Item #52 – *Plans and legal documents for compliance with West Orange COAH Ordinances.*
2. The Applicant has requested a waiver from the requirement to provide a 5 ft wide sidewalk from the new 15 parking spaces to the clubhouse as required by §25-12.1.a of the Land Used Regulations.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Montclair Golf Club (PB 24-04)
Half-Way House, Golf Building Addition & Parking Lot Improvements
Preliminary & Final Site Plan with "C" Variances - Review #2

June 4, 2024
Our File No. VWRP0151.01
Page 4

2. It states on the Site Statistics table on sheet CS101 that 383 parking spaces are existing and 387 parking spaces are proposed at the site. However, it states on the Existing and Proposed Parking Count Figures (Sheets CS200 and CS201) that 385 parking spaces are existing and 389 parking spaces are proposed. These discrepancies must be resolved.
3. It shows on sheet CG103 that the rim elevation of YD-104 will be 558.71 whereas the surrounding ground is around elevation 561.00. This discrepancy must be resolved.
4. It shows on sheet CG103 that the rim elevation of YD-104 will be 558.71 while the pipe invert elevation will be 557.61. Since a 12" HDPE pipe is proposed, the proposed pipe cover will be nearly 0 which is unacceptable. This discrepancy must be resolved.
5. Based on the invert elevations shown on sheet CG103 for YD-104 and YD-103, our office calculated the slope of the 28" HDPE pipe will be 0.54% whereas the plans show the proposed slope to be 0.50%. This discrepancy must be resolved.
6. Sheet CG103 must be revised to show the invert elevation of the 6" PVC roof drain connection where it enters the porous pavement basin.
7. It is not clear if the 6" PVC roof drain connection that enters the porous pavement basin will connect into the underdrain system or the storage bed. The plans must be revised to provide a detail of this connection.
8. It remains for the plans to be revised to include bedding and trench restoration details for the water, sanitary sewer and drainage pipes.

C. DRAINAGE COMMENTS

1. The proposed development will result in the disturbance of more than one acre. As a result, it is classified as a Major Development which requires that the project be designed to meet the stormwater runoff quality, quantity and groundwater recharge standards using green infrastructure.
2. In the Stormwater Report, Stormwater Conveyance System Design calculations show the 25-year peak flow exceed the capacities of the following storm pipe runs. This discrepancy must be resolved.
 - a. RL-101 to Porous Pavement (6" PVC)
 - b. CO-105 to MH-102 (10" HDPE)
 - c. OCS-101 to CO-105 (10" HDPE)
 - d. CB-101 to YD-101 (15" HDPE)
 - e. CB-101 to YD-101 (15" HDPE)
 - f. EX CB-101 to CB-101 (12" HDPE)



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Montclair Golf Club (PB 24-04)
Half-Way House, Golf Building Addition & Parking Lot Improvements
Preliminary & Final Site Plan with "C" Variances - Review #2

June 4, 2024
Our File No. VWRP0151.01
Page 5

3. In the Stormwater Report, the Stormwater Conveyance System Design calculations show the inverts of the pipe run between CO-105 and MH-102 to be 556.58 and 556.53. However, sheet CG103 shows the inverts of the same pipe run to be 556.52 and 556.44. This discrepancy must be resolved.
4. In the Stormwater Report, the Stormwater Conveyance System Design calculations show the inverts of the pipe run between OCS-101 and CO-105 to be 556.66 and 556.58. However, Sheet CG103 shows the inverts of the same pipe run to be 558.00 and 557.92. This discrepancy must be resolved.
5. In the Stormwater Report, the Stormwater Conveyance System Design calculations show the inverts of the pipe run between YD-102 and CO-105 to be 556.88 and 556.58. However, sheet CG103 shows the inverts of the same pipe run to be 556.83 and 556.52. This discrepancy must be resolved.
6. Soil testing must be provided in accordance with Chapter 12 of the New Jersey Stormwater Best Management Practices (BMP) Manual to verify the seasonal high-water table elevation and design permeability rates for each BMP that is proposing infiltration.
7. In the Stormwater Report, revise the calculations of the time of concentration (3A-1 through 3A-3) utilizing the McCuen-Spiess limitation.
8. Revise Stormwater Management Report to show compliance with the contributory drainage area requirement (3:1 ratio) for the Porous Pavement System in accordance with Chapter 9.6 of the New Jersey Stormwater Best Management Practices (BMP) Manual.
9. It shows on the Typical Porous Pavement Cross Section Detail on Sheet CS503 that a separation of 12" is proposed between the bottom of the stone bed and the SHWT. However, the stone bedding for the 4" perforated HDPE pipe is lower than the stone bed. Therefore, the detail should be revised to provide a minimum separation of 12" between the stone bedding for the 4" perforated HDPE pipe and the SHWT.
10. On the Typical Porous Pavement Cross Section Detail on sheet CS503, the SHWT elevation is shown as 557.00. The Applicant should clarify how the SHWT was determined.
11. The Typical Porous Pavement Cross Section Detail on sheet CS503 should be revised to note that each inspection port must be placed at least 3 feet from any edge.
12. The Porous Asphalt detail on Sheet CS501 should be revised to note that post-construction testing of the permeable asphalt surface course is required as stipulated in the NJ Best Management Practices Manual. The infiltration rate shall not be less than 20 in/hr at any location.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Planning Board
Re: Montclair Golf Club (PB 24-04)
Half-Way House, Golf Building Addition & Parking Lot Improvements
Preliminary & Final Site Plan with "C" Variances - Review #2

June 4, 2024
Our File No. VWRP0151.01
Page 6

13. The Stormwater Basin detail on sheet CS502 must be revised to show the locations of the required inspection ports.
14. The groundwater mounding analysis notes that the permeability rate of the soil is 2 in/hr and the SHWT is at elevation 538.33. Provide soil report supporting this.
15. The groundwater mounding analysis only included the mounding along the x-axis. Therefore, an additional Hantush spreadsheet is required showing the inputs of x and y being switched as required by Chapter 13 of the NJ BMP Manual to show the mounding along the other axis.
16. Our office has reviewed the Stormwater Maintenance Plan and finds it to be acceptable. As stipulated in Section 25-29.10(b)(4) of the Ordinance, the maintenance plan and any future revisions shall be recorded upon the deed of record for each property on which the maintenance described in the maintenance plan must be undertaken. Prior to recording, the form of the deed must be approved by the Planning Board Attorney and our office.

D. LANDSCAPE COMMENTS

1. Revise the plant schedules to indicate multi-stem ornamental trees to be a minimum height. Currently, trees are indicated by caliper size only.
2. Revise the 'Deciduous Tree Planting' detail, sheet LP501, to indicate rigid, plastic open mesh trunk guards to be provided to protect from the irreparable damage from buck rub.
3. Revise the 'Construction Schedule', sheet CE501, to indicate timing of tree protection fence installation and removal, to prevent confusion during construction.

E. LIGHTING COMMENTS

1. In accordance with Section 25-14.1 e., provision shall be made for the reduction in the intensity of illumination to the minimum needed for security purposes when the facility is not in operation; whereas timers and hours of operation have not been indicated.
2. Revise the plans to provide isolux pattern details with a scale and graph.

The Applicant is hereby advised that any revised plans or other documents submitted to the Board should be accompanied by a cover letter which addresses each of the comments in this review letter and also details any other changes that have been made to the plans as these may not be readily apparent.