



MEMORANDUM

**To: Chairman and Members of the
West Orange Zoning Board**

**From: John J. Hess, PE, PP, CME
Zoning Board Engineer**

Date: September 29, 2025

**Re: Application No. ZB-25-07
Mavis Tire Supply, LLC
Preliminary & Final Site Plan with 'C' and 'D'
Variances and Tree Removal Permit - Review #1
460 Prospect Avenue
Block 105, Lot 64.01
Our File: 115.WRZ0105.V01 (60001)**

**CC: Geniece Gary-Adams – Zoning Official
Zayibeth Carballo, PE, PLS, PP – Municipal Engineer
Steven Warner, Esq. – Zoning Board Attorney
Mavis Tire Supply, LLC - Applicant
Lisa A. John-Basta, Esq. – Applicant's Attorney
Rodman R. Ritchie, PE – Applicant's Engineer
Larson Design Group, Inc. – Applicant's Architect
Christine A. Nazzaro-Cifone, PP – Applicant's Planner
James A. Conway Jr., PLS - Applicant's Surveyor**

Our office has received for review the following documents which were submitted in support of the above referenced application for Preliminary & Final Site Plan with 'C' and 'D' Variances:

- A set of Preliminary and Final Site Plan drawings (20 sheets) prepared Rodman R. Ritchie, PE and Marla A. Roller, LLA with Dynamic Engineering of Marlton, New Jersey dated July 16, 2025.
- A set of unsigned architectural plans (2 sheets) prepared by Larson Design Group, Inc. of Cranberry Township, Pennsylvania, undated.
- A print of an ALTA/NSPE Land Title Survey (1 sheet) prepared by James A. Conway Jr., PLS with Dynamic Survey, LLC of Newark, New Jersey and bearing a latest revision date of December 17, 2024.
- A Drainage Statement prepared by Rodman R. Ritchie, PE, PP dated July 2025. Included with the Drainage Statement is a set of Drainage Area Maps (2 sheets) prepared by Dynamic Engineering dated July 16, 2025.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Zoning Board

September 29, 2025

Re: Mavis Tire Supply, LLC (ZB-25-07)

Our File No. 115.WRZ0105.V01 (60001)

Preliminary & Final Major Site Plan with 'C' & 'D'

Page 2

Variances and Tree Removal Permit - Review #1

- A Geotechnical Engineering Report prepared by Stephen F. Patt, PE and Jeffrey C. Yates, PE with ECS Mid-Atlantic, LLC of Moorestown, New Jersey dated December 10, 2024.
- Addendum No. 1 – Results of Test Pit Excavation and Infiltration Testing prepared by Jeffrey C. Yates, PE and Stephen F. Patt, PE dated January 29, 2025.
- A Traffic Impact Study prepared by Patrick Downey, PE, PTOE and Justin Taylor, PE, PTOE with Dynamic Traffic of Newtown, Pennsylvania dated July 21, 2025.
- A Consulting Report prepared by Christine A. Nazzaro-Cofone, PP with Cofone Consulting Group of Red Bank, New Jersey dated July 22, 2025.
- A completed Application Form dated July 16, 2025.
- A Disclosure of all entities and individuals having a ten percent (10%) or greater interest in Mavis Tire Supply LLC.
- A completed Application for Tree Removal & Replacement Permit dated August 11, 2025.
- A completed Site Plan/Subdivision Checklist.
- A completed Sustainability Checklist Form.
- A Preliminary List of Variances & Waivers prepared by Dynamic Engineering dated July 2025.
- A July 9, 2025 Buffer Report from the Office of the Assessor which lists the properties within 200 ft of Block 105, Lot 64.01.
- A copy of a July 8, 2025 Verification of Taxes & Sewer Charges Paid from the Office of the Tax Collector which states that the taxes are paid until July 31, 2025, the 2025 sewer charges have been paid and the 2025 sewer charges have not yet been billed.
- Copies of various deed documents for the property in question.
- Copies of the following Zoning Board of Adjustment Resolutions of Approval for the property in question:
 - Zoning Board of Adjustment Case No. ZB 84-21 dated January 17, 1985.
 - Zoning Board of Adjustment Case No. ZB 84-21 dated February 14, 1985.
 - Zoning Board of Adjustment Case No. ZB 02-27 dated October 17, 2002.

We have reviewed the submitted information and offer the following comments:

A. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The property in question is a rectangular tract which fronts on the easterly side of Prospect Avenue approximately 826 ft north of the intersection with Marcella Avenue. It has an area of 32,118 sf or approximately 0.74 acres and is located in the B-2 Zoning District. The property is currently occupied by a 3,334 sf 2-story office building which has been used as a realtor's office. According to the Resolution of Approval for Case No. ZB-02-27, 19 parking spaces were approved in front of the building and an additional 10 parking spaces at the southerly end of the property.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Zoning Board

September 29, 2025

Re: Mavis Tire Supply, LLC (ZB-25-07)

Our File No. 115.WRZ0105.V01 (60001)

Preliminary & Final Major Site Plan with 'C' & 'D'

Page 3

Variances and Tree Removal Permit - Review #1

The Applicant is seeking Preliminary & Final Site Plan approval with 'C' and 'D' variances and a Tree Removal Permit to demolish the existing structure and pavement and to construct a new 6,952 sf automotive service facility with 8 service bays and a 1,482 sf retail sales area including a showroom, sales counter, waiting area and restrooms. On-site parking is proposed for 19 vehicles including 1 handicap accessible parking space. In addition, access is proposed to the site via a right in/ right out two-way driveway from Prospect Avenue. In addition, a full movement driveway is proposed on the southerly side of the site which will connect to Blueberry Bend which is a private road. The stormwater runoff from the site will be collected and discharged to an existing 15" pipe which exits the property at the northeast corner of the site. .

B. DESIGN COMMENTS

1. Based on our review, we find that the following items from the Township's Site Plan/Subdivision Checklist must be addressed:
 - a) Item #14 – *Affidavit of ownership.*
 - b) Item #23 - *List of required regulatory approvals or permits.*
 - c) Item #46 – *Solid waste management plan.*
 - d) Item #48 – *Sight triangles.*
 - e) Item #52 – *Plans and legal documents for compliance with West Orange COAH Ordinances.*
2. The Applicant has requested the following waivers in support of this application:
 - a) From the requirement to provide a minimum illumination level of 2.0 FC for the parking areas.
 - b) From the requirement to provide road and paving cross-sections and profiles.
3. As part of this application, the Applicant has applied for a tree removal permit. As stipulated in §28-4 of the Township Code, the Applicant must demonstrate that the items set forth in §28-4.e have been addressed. We note that the Applicant must submit a report from a Qualified Tree Expert which addresses the factors set forth in §28-6. In addition, sheet 4 must be revised to identify size and type of each tree that is proposed to be removed.
4. The Site Plan (sheet 5) must be revised to show the dimensions of the proposed building.
5. It states on sheet 5 that the total building area will be 6,952 sf whereas it states in the Consulting Report that an approximately 7,700 sf building is proposed. This discrepancy must be resolved.
6. The Applicant should address the Board regarding the proposed hours of operation of the Mavis Tire Center and the hours of operation of the proposed site lighting. We recommend that light levels be dimmed/turned off one hour after closing, to reduce light pollution.
7. The Applicant should address the Board regarding the proposed frequency and hours for deliveries to the site.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Zoning Board

September 29, 2025

Re: Mavis Tire Supply, LLC (ZB-25-07)

Our File No. 115.WRZ0105.V01 (60001)

Preliminary & Final Major Site Plan with 'C' & 'D'

Page 4

Variances and Tree Removal Permit - Review #1

8. The Applicant should address the Board regarding their plans to install sidewalks along the site frontage.
9. The Applicant should address the Board regarding their plans to provide a loading space as required by §25-12.3 of the Township Code.
10. It states on sheet 5 that Prospect Avenue has a variable ROW width. The plans should be revised to show the existing ROW width and the ROW half-width in front of the property in question. In addition, the Applicant should address the Board regarding whether the Essex County Planning Board will require a ROW dedication along the site frontage.
11. The Applicant should address the Board regarding their plans to provide an Electric Vehicle charging station or Make-Ready parking space as required by §25-12.6 of the Township Code.
12. It shows on sheet 5 that the Applicant proposes a driveway connection to Blueberry Bend which is a private road. The Applicant must demonstrate that they have the necessary approval from the Owner of Blueberry Bend to permit the proposed driveway connection.
13. Sheet 5 shows that there is a door on the southerly side of the building which opens into the drive aisle. The Applicant should address the Board regarding their plans to install bollards or other safety measures to protect pedestrians using this door from injury.
14. It shows on sheet 5 that a 10'x10' masonry trash enclosure is proposed at the southeast corner of the building. The Applicant should provide testimony to the Board to demonstrate that the proposed trash enclosure will have adequate capacity to accommodate the trash and recyclables that will be generated at the site.
15. It shows on sheet 5 that the proposed trash enclosure will be located close to the rear property line. We note that the property in question abuts an existing residential neighborhood. The Applicant should address the Board regarding the anticipated frequency and hours of pickup. Our office is concerned with the potential noise impacts on the adjoining residential properties.
16. It states on sheet 5 that the trash enclosure will have a board on board gate. However, the trash enclosure detail on sheet 15 shows that a chain link gate is proposed. This discrepancy must be resolved.
17. The Drainage & Utility Plan (sheet 7) shows an existing manhole at the southeast corner of the site which could not be opened. The plans must be revised to clarify the purpose of this manhole and to show any associated piping.
18. It shows on sheet 7 that the light pole adjacent to the trash enclosure will be installed directly over the proposed 1.25" copper water line which is unacceptable. The water line should be relocated to ensure that it is not damaged during construction.
19. Sheet 15 includes a Typical Fire Hydrant and Valve Installation detail. Therefore, the sheet 7 must be revised to show where a fire hydrant is proposed.
20. Sheet 15 includes a Storm Sewer Doghouse Manhole Detail. Therefore, sheet 7 must be revised to show where a doghouse manhole is proposed.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Zoning Board

September 29, 2025

Re: Mavis Tire Supply, LLC (ZB-25-07)

Our File No. 115.WRZ0105.V01 (60001)

Preliminary & Final Major Site Plan with 'C' & 'D'

Page 5

Variances and Tree Removal Permit - Review #1

21. The Full Depth Pavement Repair Detail on sheet 15 must be revised to specify the thickness of the surface course, the base course and the DGA course.
22. Sheet 16 includes a Wet Tap Detail and a Gate Valve and Box Detail. Therefore, sheet 7 must be revised to show where a wet tap and a gate valve with box are proposed.
23. The plans should be revised to include the following details:
 - a) Crosswalk.
 - b) Type E inlet.
 - c) 4'Ø sanitary manhole.

C. STORMWATER MANAGEMENT COMMENTS

1. On May 20, 2025, the Township of West Orange adopted Ordinance 2918-25 which amended the Township's Stormwater Control Ordinance (SCO). This Ordinance defines a major development as one which individually or collectively results in:
 - a. The disturbance of 0.5 acre of land since February 2, 2004.
 - b. The creation of 5,000 square feet or more of "regulated impervious surface" since February 2, 2004.
 - c. The creation of 5,000 square feet or more of "regulated motor vehicle surface" since March 2, 2021, or
 - d. A combination of b and c above that totals 5,000 square feet or more. The same surface shall not be counted twice when determining if the combination area equals one-quarter acre or more.

It shows on sheet 12 that the area of disturbance will be 28,562 sf or 0.66 acres. As a result, this project is classified as a major development and must comply with the requirements in Ordinance 2918-25. In addition, the Applicant must submit an Application for Stormwater Permit and must pay the stormwater permit fee stipulated in Resolution 153-25 which was adopted by the Township on June 24, 2025.

2. The Drainage Statement indicates that the project is not subject to the stormwater management quantity, quality and recharge requirements set forth at NJAC 7:8. While this statement is true, the proposed design does not address the requirements set forth in the Township's new Stormwater Control Ordinance which is stricter than NJAC 7:8. Therefore, a revised Drainage Statement must be submitted to the Board. Our office reserves the right to offer additional comments once a revised Drainage Statement has been submitted.
3. As stipulated in Ordinance 2918-25, the Applicant must submit maintenance plan for the stormwater management system. We note that the maintenance plan and any future revisions must be recorded upon the deed of record for the property. Prior to recording, the form of the deed must be approved by the Board Attorney and our office.



Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Zoning Board

September 29, 2025

Re: Mavis Tire Supply, LLC (ZB-25-07)

Our File No. 115.WRZ0105.V01 (60001)

Preliminary & Final Major Site Plan with 'C' & 'D'

Page 6

Variances and Tree Removal Permit - Review #1

4. The ALTA/NSPS Land Title Survey and the Demolition Plan (sheet 4) show a paved over grate in the existing driveway from Prospect Avenue. However, this grate and any associated piping is not shown on the Drainage & Utility Plan (sheet 7). The plans should be revised to show the existing grate and piping and to clarify the future plans for this grate and piping.

D. LANDSCAPING COMMENTS

1. The existing shrubs along the landscape wall near the stop bar at Prospect Avenue are not indicated on the plans if they are to be removed or maintained. We recommend this shrub grouping be removed due to consisting of barberry, a highly invasive species.
2. Revise the plans to shift proposed shade trees further away from curbs, where possible. Also, our office does not recommend providing a shade tree next to the existing Norway Spruce tree, due to spatial constraints. It appears three (3) TA (Basswood) can be provided along Prospect Avenue. Additionally, provide two (2) QA (White Oak) along the parking stalls fronting Blueberry Bend, rather than within the small parking lot island at the end of the row.
3. The Applicant has proposed SA (Sassafras) within the buffer. This species is difficult to source at the size proposed as it is not a commercially grown tree. An alternative NJ native deciduous tree should be provided.
4. Revise the plans to provide a grouping of evergreen shrubs within the parking island directly south of the proposed trash enclosure, for enhanced screening.
5. Revise the 'Landscape Schedule' on sheet 8 to indicate if the proposed ornamental trees are to be single or multi-stem. Single stem trees should be specified by caliper size. Also, indicate a minimum planting size of 18" height or spread for all proposed shrubs, including RAGL (Grow-low Sumac), JHBH (Bar Harbor Juniper) and AMGH (Ground Hug Chokeberry).

E. LIGHTING COMMENTS

1. Our office recommends shifting proposed S1(FM) towards the entrance drive to ensure this area is adequately illuminated.
2. The Applicant has proposed wallpack type building mounted light fixtures; however, our office does not find these to be acceptable. Plans should be revised to provide a full cut-off fixture to reduce glare.
3. Review and revise the plans to indicate isolux patterns and details, to include a scale and graph, for further review.
4. Revise the 'Area Light Foundation Detail' on sheet 11 to indicate a concrete strength of 4,500 PSI. Currently, 4,000 PSI is indicated on the plans.
5. Revise the plans to provide the catalog cuts for all proposed light poles and fixtures, for further review. Also, include ordering information for the proposed light pole.
6. Revise the plans to indicate proposed color and finish for all fixtures and poles.



**Consulting & Municipal
ENGINEERS**

Chairman and Members of the West Orange Township Zoning Board

September 29, 2025

Re: Mavis Tire Supply, LLC (ZB-25-07)

Our File No. 115.WRZ0105.V01 (60001)

Preliminary & Final Major Site Plan with 'C' & 'D'

Page 7

Variances and Tree Removal Permit - Review #1

The Applicant is hereby advised that any revised plans or other documents submitted to the Board should be accompanied by a cover letter which addresses each of the comments in this review letter and also details any other changes that have been made to the plans as these may not be readily apparent.