



October 27, 2025

John J. Hess, P.E., P.P., C.M.E.
CME Associates
Zoning Board Engineer
Township of West Orange
66 Main Street
West Orange, New Jersey 07052

George Wheatle Williams, PP, AICP
Principal
Nishuane Group, LLC
105 Grove Street, Suite 3
Montclair, New Jersey 07042

RE: **Engineering Review**
Application No. ZB-25-04
Panorama LLC
Amended Preliminary and Final Site Plan, Bulk Variance
& Tree Removal and Replacement Permit - Review #1
410 Eagle Rock Avenue
Block 109, Lot 1.01
Block 111, Lot 1.05
Our File: 115.WRZ0109.V01
Petry No: 24-085

RE: **Planning Review Letter**
410 Eagle Rock Avenue
Block #109 & 111, Lots 1.01 & 1.05
Amended Major Site Plan Approval
ZB-25-04

RE: **Site Plan Review Advisory Board Report**
410 Eagle Rock Avenue
Block #109 & 111, Lot: 1.01 & 1.05
Amended Major Site Plan Approval
ZB-25-4

Dear Mr. Hess and Mr. Wheatle:

155 Passaic Avenue, Suite 350, Fairfield, New Jersey 07004
973-227-7004 973-227-7074 (fax)
www.petryengineering.com

Pursuant to your letters dated June 16, 2025 (Engineering Review), July 25, 2025 (Planning Review), and August 22, 2025 (SPRAB Report), we have revised our plans and reports. Below is a detailed response letter addressing each one of your comments individually. Please see below for the following documents in this resubmission:

- Amended Preliminary & Final Site Plan dated January 24, 2025, and revised through October 27, 2025.
- Drainage Statement dated January 24, 2025, and revised through October 27, 2025.
- Site Plan Submission Checklist

B. Design Comments

1. The Applicant must submit a completed Site Plan/Subdivision Submission Checklist to the Board.

PETRY RESPONSE: The Site Plan Submission Checklist has been included in this resubmission.

2. Based on our review of the submitted documents, we request that the following additional information be submitted as stipulated on the Site Plan/Subdivision Checklist:
 - a) Item #7 — *Proof that taxes are current for Block 109, Lot 1.01.*
 - b) Item #20 — *Copy and/or delineation of any existing or proposed deed restrictions or covenants.*
 - c) Item #24 — *List of variances required or requested.*
 - d) Item #25 — *List of design waivers required or requested.*
 - e) Item #31 — *Contours to extend at least 200' beyond subject property.*

PETRY RESPONSE: Items #7 & #20 will be provided by the attorney. The application requires a variance for construction within 100 feet of the face of the cliff and a variance for parking (despite the fact that we are adding parking without increasing the need; no waivers). Our submittal sheet SP-1 includes 2-foot contours within 200 feet of the property per the West Orange Aerial Mapping dated 2010. The cliff face is near vertical, preventing the applicant from providing 2-foot contour intervals.



3. The Site Data Chart on SP-1 indicates that the Owner and Applicant is Panorama LLC whereas the application form shows that the Applicant is Panorama, LLC and the Owner is Thea LLC. This discrepancy must be resolved.

PETRY RESPONSE: The plans have been revised to show the owner as Thea, LLC (See Sheet SP-1).

4. SP-4 includes a callout which states that pervious asphalt pavement is proposed for the drive aisle and parking spaces. However, sheet SP-10 includes a Granite Block Curb & Pavement Detail which shows that standard (non-pervious) pavement is proposed. This discrepancy must be resolved.

PETRY RESPONSE: The plans have been revised to reflect the standard pavement since the soils are currently dense, and the bedrock is high making pervious pavement impractical (See Sheet SP-4).

5. If a pervious pavement system is proposed, then a pervious pavement detail must be added to the plans. The detail must indicate the seasonal high-water table elevation and the bottom of the stone storage bed elevation to ensure sufficient separation is provided. The detail should also indicate the locations of filter fabric. In addition, the detail must clarify if the pervious pavement system will be an infiltration system or an under drained system and the appropriate details must be added to the plans.

PETRY RESPONSE: The plans have been revised to call out asphalt pavement throughout; thus, a pervious pavement detail is not required (See Sheet SP-4).

6. The Test Pit Locations and Soil Permeability Map included in the Drainage Statement includes soil testing information that was completed on January 8, 2025, by Johnson Soils Company. Therefore, a copy of the soil investigation report should be provided to the Board and to our office.

PETRY RESPONSE: A copy of the Soil Investigation Report has been added to the Drainage Statement.

7. The plans should be revised to include construction details for the following site improvements:

- a) Do Not Enter Sign;



- b) No Right-Turn Sign;
- c) Right Turn Only Sign;
- d) Electric Vehicle Parking Sign;
- e) 4" White Striping;
- f) Yellow "No Parking" Striping.

PETRY RESPONSE: The plans have been revised to include the signage and striping details (See Sheet SP-10).

8. Provide a vehicle circulation plan that shows the circulation of the largest vehicle that is anticipated to visit the site. Additionally, the circulation plan should address fire and emergency vehicles.

PETRY RESPONSE: Vehicle circulation plans have been added to the Amended Preliminary and Final Site Plan (See Sheets TM-1, TM-2 and TM-3).

9. Revise the Light Base Detail on sheet SP-6 to indicate a concrete strength of 4,500 PSI.

PETRY RESPONSE: The plans have been revised to reflect the 4,500-psi concrete strength (See Sheet SP-6).

10. It shows on sheet SP-7 that 9 trees are proposed to be removed. As stipulated in §25-27.5.c of the Land Use Regulations, the Applicant must submit a qualified tree expert's report which addresses the standards in §25-27.7.

PETRY RESPONSE: A separate report is being submitted with the tree removal application.

11. Sheet SP-7 should be revised to note the species and sizes of the trees that are proposed to be removed.

PETRY RESPONSE: The tree sizes are included, based upon the survey data. Species and condition will be reflected in the tree experts' report.



12. The replacement trees provided should be NJ native species. Therefore, sheet SP-7 should be revised to comply.

PETRY RESPONSE: The replacement trees were selected from the Essex County Native Tree and Shrub List from the Township of West Orange's Forestry website (See PDF of list from the Township of West Orange's website at the end of the response letter).

13. Revise SP-7 to include a note indicating that no one shall cut or remove trees without first obtaining a tree removal and replacement permit from the Township.

PETRY RESPONSE: A note to this effect has been added to the plans (See Sheet SP-7).

14. Revise SP-7 to include a note indicating if any replacement tree planted fails to thrive or dies within two years, it shall be replaced within six months and the same shall be viable for an additional two (2) years.

PETRY RESPONSE: A note to this effect has been added to the plans (See Sheet SP-7).

Planning Review Letter Comments

1. The applicant shall provide testimony to the Board that the C variance required is due to a hardship (C1) or that the decreased distance from a cliff face is not a substantial detriment when weighed against the perceived public benefits of additional parking that is closer to the required number associated with the use and the purposed of zoning would be advanced by the board granting the variance (C2).

PETRY RESPONSE: The Applicant's planner will provide testimony to the Board.

2. The applicant shall testify to any alternative parking arrangements made with adjacent sites and whether those arrangements would continue should the Board approve the application.

PETRY RESPONSE: The Applicant's engineer will provide testimony to the Board.



3. The applicant states it is providing 4 ADA spaces; however, 5 ADA spaces are required for total parking spaces between 101 and 150. The applicant shall identify an additional space for an ADA parking stall.

PETRY RESPONSE: An additional space for an ADA parking stall is not required as the credits for EV spaces do not count towards the requirement for ADA spaces. Additionally, the 4 land-banked spaces are not being constructed. The actual number of spaces being constructed is 96 spaces. As such, the 4 ADA spaces are appropriate.

SPRAB Report Comments

1. **Stormwater:** The stormwater infrastructure associated with the improvements will tie into the existing stormwater system on site. The applicant will revise the plan to remove references to the use of non-porous pavement. The Township Engineer questioned whether the applicant had to meet the requirements of Ordinance 2918-25, which was adopted on May 20, 2025. The date of application is April 24, 2025 and therefore is not subject to the revised ordinance.

PETRY RESPONSE: Statement; no response required.

2. **Electric Vehicle (EV) Spaces:** One ADA space is required to include an EV charger. (See notes on ADA spaces below). It was recommended the EV spaces be moved as far from the building as possible. The applicant agreed to move them further away.

PETRY RESPONSE: The EV Spaces except for the ADA EV space are placed the furthest from the building (See Sheet SP-4).

3. **ADA Parking:** It was confirmed that the credits for EV spaces do not count towards the requirement for ADA spaces, so 4 ADA spaces are required as provided on the plans. The applicant will look at the grades to be able to move the ADA spaces to the further to the right in front of the building to accommodate the required ADA EV space.

PETRY RESPONSE: An ADA EV space has been provided (See Sheet SP-4).

4. **Vehicle Turning Movements:** The Fire Captain inquired as to whether the parking addition could support a ladder truck making turns there. The applicant stated they would



run a turning template to indicate the turns could be made. The Board Engineer requested a Vehicle Circulation Plan and the applicant agreed to provide one.

PETRY RESPONSE: A Vehicle Circulation Plan for the fire and refuse truck has been provided (See Sheets TM-1, TM-2 and TM-3).

5. **Pedestrian Circulation:** The applicant was asked to look at all possible accommodations for pedestrians walking from these rear parking lot spaces. The applicant was also requested to meet with the Pedestrian Safety Advisory Board, which the applicant agreed to do. After the meeting, it was communicated a member of the Committee was invited to the SPRAB and was in attendance.

PETRY RESPONSE: The plans have been revised to include striped walkways for pedestrians from the rear parking lot area (See Sheet SP-4). The Applicant will meet with the Pedestrian Safety Advisory Board regarding pedestrian circulation.

6. **Off-site Parking:** The applicant currently uses available parking at 424 Eagle Rock Avenue for overflow, but its long term available is unknown once Iron Culture Gym opens. It was recommended and agreed upon that the applicant contact the owners of 414 Eagle Rock Avenue for the use of parking spaces on the weekends.

PETRY RESPONSE: Statement; no response required.

7. **Refuse:** It was asked, and the applicant confirmed the garbage and recycling area in the rear of the building is remaining the same.

PETRY RESPONSE: Statement; no response required.

We trust that we have provided sufficient information for your continued review. Should you have any questions or concerns, please feel free to contact us.

Very truly yours,

PETRY ENGINEERING, LLC

J. Michael Petry

J. Michael Petry, PE, PP, AIA



Township of West Orange Preferred Tree Planting List	
Scientific Name	Common Name
Large Shade Trees	
<i>Acer saccharum</i> "Green Mountain"	"Green Mountain" Sugar maple
<i>Celtis occidentalis</i>	Eastern hackberry
<i>Corylus columnata</i>	Turkish filbert
<i>Eucommia ulmoides</i>	Hardy rubber tree
<i>Gleditsia triacanthos</i> "enermis"	Thornless honey-locust
<i>Metasequoia glyptostroboides</i>	Dawn-redwood
<i>Nyssa sylvatica</i>	Blackgum
<i>Quercus accutissima</i>	Sawtooth oak
<i>Quercus bicolor</i>	Swamp white oak
<i>Quercus cerris</i>	Turkey oak
<i>Quercus imbricaria</i>	Shingle oak
<i>Quercus lyrata</i>	Overcup oak
<i>Quercus macrocarpa</i>	Burr oak
<i>Betula nigra</i>	River Birch
<i>Taxodium distichum</i> "Shawnee Brave"	"Shawnee Brave" Baldcypress
<i>Tilia Americana</i> "Redmond"	"Redmond" American basswood
<i>Tilia cordata</i>	Little-leaf linden
<i>Ulmus americana</i> "princeton"	Princeton elm
<i>Liquidambar orientalis</i>	Sweet Gum (seedless)
Small to Medium Trees	
<i>Acer buergerianum</i>	Trident maple
<i>Acer campestre</i>	Hedge maple
<i>Acer ginnella</i>	Amur maple
<i>Acer tataricum</i>	Tartarian maple
<i>Acer griseum</i>	Paperbark maple
<i>Cercidiphyllum japonicum</i>	Katsuratree
<i>Cladrastis kentuckia</i> , "Sweet Shade, Perkins Pink"	Yellowwood - cultivars
<i>Crataegus</i> spp.	Hawthorne
<i>Cornus x rutgersensis</i> , "Aurora, Stellar Pink, Constellation"	Hybrid Flowering dogwood
<i>Koeleria paniculata</i>	Goldenrain tree
<i>Magnolia acuminata</i> x Elizabeth	Flowering cucumber tree
<i>Magnolia virginiana</i>	Sweetbay magnolia
<i>Malus</i> x "Centzam"	"Centzam" Flowering crabapple
<i>Malus</i> x "Hargozam"	"Hargozam" Flowering crabapple
<i>Malus</i> x "India Magic"	"India Magic" Flowering crabapple
<i>Parrotia persica</i>	Persian parrotia
<i>Syringa reticulata</i>	Japanese tree-lilac
<i>Oxydendrum arboreum</i>	Sourwood
Ornamental and Fastigate Trees	
<i>Amelanchier canadensis</i> "White Pillar"	"White Pillar" tree form Serviceberry
<i>Amelanchier x grandiflora</i> "Robin Hill"	"Robin Hill" tree form Serviceberry
<i>Acer rubrum</i> "Armstrong"	Fastigate hybrid maple
<i>Acer saccharum</i> "Columnaris, Monumentale, Goldspire"	Hybrid columnar Sugar maple
<i>Carpinus caroliniana</i>	American hornbeam
<i>Cornus mas</i>	Cornelian cherry
<i>Crataegus</i> "Winter King"	"Winter King" Hawthorn
<i>Ginkgo biloba</i> "Mager"	"Magar" Ginkgo
<i>Ginkgo biloba</i> "Princeton Sentry"	Columnar Ginkgo
<i>Halesia carolina</i>	Carolina silverbell
<i>Halesia carolina</i> "Rosea"	"Rosea" Carolina silverbell
<i>Halesia monticola</i>	Mountain silverbell
<i>Malus baccata</i> "columnaris" "Walters"	"Walters" Columnar Siberian crabapple
<i>Malus</i> x "Red Baron"	"Red Baron" Flowering crabapple
<i>Oxydendrum arboreum</i>	Sourwood
<i>Sorbus alnifolia</i>	Korean mountain-ash
<i>Stewartia koreana</i>	Korean stewartia
<i>Stewartia pseudocamellia</i>	Japanese stewartia
<i>Styrax japonicus</i>	Japanese snowbell
<i>Taxodium ascendens</i> "Nutans, Prairie Sentinel"	"Nutans, Prairie Sentinel" Pondcypress

*If you would prefer to plant a tree that is not on the list, please contact Township Forester, Walt Kipp at Wkipp@westorange.org