

TO: Township of West Orange Planning Board

FROM: Malvika Apte, PP, AICP, Planning Board Planner 
Langley Oudemans, Associate Planner

RE: PB Application 26-03
Planning Review # 1
750 Eagle Rock Avenue
Block 174, Lot 1.01
Amended Preliminary & Final Major Site Plan Approval with "C" Variances

DATE: June 3, 2026

1. Materials Reviewed

As requested, we have reviewed the following materials:

- Five (5) pages of Township of West Orange Application Form, dated March 10, 2026;
- One (1) page of revised first page of Township of West Orange Application Form, undated;
- Three (3) pages of Variance Request Narrative, dated March 10, 2026;
- Six (6) pages of Township of West Orange Site Plan Checklist, undated;
- One (1) page of Sustainability Checklist, undated;
- Twenty-three (23) pages of Township of West Orange Tree Removal and Replacement Permit Application, dated March 10, 2026;
- Five (5) pages of Tree Removal and Replacement Application Explanation to Prohibitions prepared by Langan Engineering and Environmental Services, LLC, dated March 10, 2026;
- Two (2) pages of Site Plan Waiver Requests prepared by Langan Engineering and Environmental Services, LLC, dated March 10, 2026;
- One (1) page of Verification of Taxes and Sewer Charges Paid prepared by Township of West Orange Tax Collector, dated February 11, 2026;
- Seven (7) pages of Township of West Orange 200' Property Owners List prepared by Sr. Assessing Clerk, Shayne Radice, dated February 12, 2026;
- Nine (9) pages of Borough of Roseland 200' Property Owners List prepared by Kevin Esposito, CTA, dated April 5, 2024; ***This list needs to be updated.***
- Ten (10) pages of Township of Livingston 200' Property Owners List prepared by Lidia Dumytsch, dated February 9, 2026;

- Seven (7) pages of Planning Board Resolution for Application PB23-06 for Minor Site Plan Approval at Crestmont Country Club, prepared by Township of West Orange Planning Board, memorialized July 19, 2023;
- Ten (10) pages of Zoning Board Resolution for ZB-24-07 Crestmont Country Club prepared by Zoning Board of Adjustment of the Township of West Orange, dated November 21, 2024;
- One (1) page of W-9 Form for West Essex Highlands, Inc. dated March 5, 2026; ***We defer to the Director of Planning on this item, however W-9 form for the applicant on record may be required.***
- Nine hundred and ninety four (994) pages of Stormwater Management Report for Crestmont Country Club & Eagle Rock Avenue Improvements prepared by Langan Engineering and Environmental Services, LLC, dated February 12, 2026;
- Twenty-two (22) pages of Stormwater Operation and Maintenance Manual for Crestmont Country Club & Eagle Rock Avenue Improvements prepared by Langan Engineering and Environmental Services, LLC, dated February 12, 2026;
- Sixty-one (61) pages of Environmental Impact Statement for Crestmont Country Club & Eagle Rock Avenue Improvements prepared by Langan Engineering and Environmental Services, LLC, dated February 12, 2026;
- Seventy (70) pages of Traffic Signal Design Report for the Intersection of Eagle Rock Avenue and Oval Road/Laurel Avenue prepared by Langan Engineering and Environmental Services LLC, dated January 21, 2026;
- Thirty-six (36) sheets of Preliminary and Final Major Site Plans for Crestmont Country Club and Eagle Rock Avenue Improvements prepared by Langan Engineering and Environmental Services, LLC, dated February 12, 2026;
- Four (4) sheets of Crestmont Country Club Tree Restoration Plans, prepared by Langan Engineering and Environmental Services, LLC, dated February 12, 2026;
- Six (6) sheets of Crestmont Country Club Right of Way and Partial Site Survey, prepared by Langan Engineering and Environmental Services, LLC, dated February 11, 2026;
- Four (4) sheets of Crestmont Country Club Steep Slope Analysis Exhibits prepared by Langan Engineering and Environmental Services, LLC, dated February 12, 2026;
- Twenty-two (22) sheets of Preliminary Eagle Rock Avenue Roadway Improvement Plans prepared by Langan Engineering and Environmental Services, LLC., dated February 12, 2026.

2. Site Description

The subject property, identified as Lot 1.01 within Block 174 in the Township tax records, is located at 750 Eagle Rock Avenue. The portion of the property that is the subject of this review is located in the northern

section of the property and is directly adjacent to Eagle Rock Avenue between Laurel Avenue and Wakeman Street. The proposed project site is currently developed as a portion of the Crestmont Country Club Property. The entire property is approximately 146 acres in the Township's R-2 Zone, and the project area is approximately 3.95 acres with frontage on Eagle Rock Avenue. The site is adjacent to residential properties in the R-4 and R-5 Zones.

The site includes several structures adjacent to the project area, including a 2-story masonry building, 1-story metal building, 1-story masonry building, and a 1-story modular building. These structures abut the existing parking area, but are not proposed to undergo any changes.



Subject Site Aerial
Source: NJ Geo Web

3. Proposed Project Review:

- i. The applicant is seeking amended preliminary and final site plan approval to reconstruct the egress driveway from the existing parking area to Eagle Rock Avenue and install a traffic signal at the new intersection with the egress driveway, Eagle Rock Avenue, and Oval Road.
- ii. Four (4) cross walks are proposed at each street.
- iii. The applicant is proposing 36 new parking spaces.
- iv. Site improvements include removal of pavement, milling and paving of new pavement, grading, retaining walls, drainage systems, two bioretention basins 4-foot wide sidewalk,
- v. No buildings/structures are proposed as part of this application.

4. Zoning Review

- i. **Proposed Use:** The subject property is located in the R-2 Zone: One-Family Dwellings on 40,000 square foot lots, where golf courses and golf course club houses are permitted principal uses, and required parking is a permitted accessory use.
- ii. **Bulk Standards:** The following table notes the bulk regulations that are permitted in the R-2 Zone and the proposed site plans compliance/non-compliance with the same.

Bulk Standards for Golf Courses in R-2 Zone			
	Ordinance Requirements	Existing	Proposed
Min. Lot Area (Chapter 25 Attachment 3)	40,000 sf	6,400,399 sf	6,390,953 sf
Min Lot Frontage/Width (Chapter 25 Attachment 3)	125 ft	986 ft	986 ft
Min. Front Setback (Chapter 25 Attachment 3)	25 ft	291.5 ft	285.6 ft
Minimum Side Front Yard-Corner Lot (Chapter 25 Attachment 3)	35 ft	461.3 ft	461.3
Min. Side Setback (Chapter 25 Attachment 3)	20 + 20 ft	408 ft	408 ft

Min. Rear Setback (Chapter 25 Attachment 3)	45 ft	453.9 ft	453.9 ft
Max. Building Height (Chapter 25 Attachment 3)	2.5 stories / 35 ft	-	No new structures proposed
Max. Building Cover (Chapter 25 Attachment 3)	20%	1.1%	No change
Max. Impervious Cover (Chapter 25 Attachment 3)	30%	6.76%	6.96%

5. Site Plan Review

A. Landscaping and Fencing:

i. Trees:

- The applicant is proposing to remove a total of 313 trees, including 1 <4" in DBH, 120 between 4" and 5.9" DBH, 127 between 6" and 12.9" DBH, 54 between 13" and 22.9" DBH, 10 between 23" and 32.99" DBH, and 2 >33" DBH.
- Based on the tree replacement requirements, the applicant is required to plant 120 trees that are a minimum 2.5" caliper and 266 that are a minimum of 4" caliper, totaling 586 replacement trees.
- 542 trees are proposed to be replaced on-site, and the remaining 44 trees are proposed to be planted off-site. **Approval from the Township Forester is required.**
- The parking area is required to have 11 trees based on the number of spaces proposed. **The eleven (11) trees in the parking area are in addition to the replacement trees required for tree removal. Applicant to include these trees to the satisfaction of the Township Forester.**

ii. Fences/Walls

- Applicant is proposing a four-foot-high split rail fence with non-climbable mesh surrounding the bioretention basins with a 10ft-wide double-swing access gate.
- A reinforced modular block retaining wall is proposed adjacent to portions of the driveway, parking areas, and Eagle Rock Avenue to account for changes in grade across the site. The retaining wall varies in height, with a maximum height of 21.2 ft. **This requires a variance for height of a solid wall.**

Requirements for Walls and Fences (§ 25-8.4)		
Ordinance Requirements	Existing	Proposed
Walls and fences which are not more than 50% solid are permitted anywhere on the property, in all districts, provided they are not higher than four feet	-	4 ft split rail fence

In all nonresidential districts, fences or walls not exceeding six feet in height shall be permitted in the side and rear yards provided the fence or wall is not closer than five feet at any point to a principal building in a residential district.	-	Modular block retaining wall with a maximum height of 21.2 ft (V)
---	---	--

V = Bulk variance required

B. Steep Slopes (§ 25-28):

- i. This proposal includes disturbance of steep slope areas of the property. **The proposal requires one (1) variance related to excessive disturbance of steep slopes including:**
 - a. 10.9% disturbance of a 25% or greater slope area (0% disturbance permitted) (V).
- ii. A minimum setback of proposed improvements to the top of the steep slope area between 10-30% is 50 ft whereas 10ft is proposed. **A variance is required (V).**
- iii. A minimum setback of proposed improvements to the top of the steep slopes >30% is 100ft whereas 10ft is proposed. **A variance is required (V).**
- iv. Several trees are proposed to be removed in areas of the site with a slope of 10% or greater. **A waiver is required for the removal of trees on slopes with a grade of 10% or greater.**

C. Parking and Loading:

- i. The parking area includes a proposed one-way (exit only) access drive from Eagle Rock Avenue, where a new four-way signalized intersection is proposed.
- ii. Visitors to the site can enter the parking area from an existing driveway on Laurel Avenue.
- iii. The parking area includes 24-foot, two-way drive aisles throughout, with painted directional arrows, stop signs and painted stop bars.
- iv. A cluster of seventeen (17) parking spaces in the eastern section of the improvement area will include porous pavement.
- v. The proposed parking plan includes 103 newly constructed spaces in the existing parking area. This includes the replacement of existing spaces. There is a net increase of 36 spaces, from 256 to 292 spaces in the parking area.
 - a. Of the proposed spaces, two (2) are standard EV spaces.
 - b. No new ADA spaces are proposed.
- vi. A fire truck circulation diagram was submitted as part of the application materials.
- vii. No bicycle parking is proposed as part of this application.

Parking and Loading Space Requirements			
	Ordinance Requirements	Existing	Proposed
Minimum Number of Off-Street Parking Spaces (§25-12.2)	Private Clubs: 1 for each 45 sf of gross floor area (31,500 sf/45) = 700 spaces required	256	292 (V)
General Provisions for Off-Street Parking (§25-12.4)	An access drive to an off-street parking area or truck-loading space may be located within a	>5 ft	5.5 ft

	required side yard, but shall not be located within five feet of a side lot line.		
	Off-street parking surfaced with asphalt, bituminous, or cement binder and graded to dispose of all surface water.	Asphalt	Asphalt pavement and porous asphalt pavement
	Parking spaces clearly marked showing parking arrangement and traffic direction.	Two-way arrows painted on ground	Two-way arrows painted on ground
	Service Aisle Standards: 90-degree angle parking = 24' aisle width. Two-way.	24ft two-way aisle with 90-degree angle parking	24ft two-way aisle with 90-degree angle parking
	Parking area entrance/exit at least 50' from residential district	Entrance is within the R-2 district. >50 ft from residential use	Entrance is within the R-2 district. >50 ft from residential use
	Standard size parking spaces shall have minimum dimensions of 9 feet by 18 feet	-	9 ft x 18 ft
Length of Parking Row	20 spaces maximum	-	Max. 16 spaces in a row
Min. Distance from Parking Area Curb to Fencing/Screening	5 ft	>5 ft	3 ft (V)
Curb Enclosing Parking Areas	Concrete or granite block		Granite block
Minimum Driveway Slope	6%	10.5%	Laurel 10.5% (ENC) Eagle Rock 8.5% (V)
Parking Area Landscaping (§25-12.1i)	In parking areas with 30 or more parking spaces, there shall be a minimum of one tree plus ground level planting for each 10 parking stalls, which may be provided within and/or on the perimeter of the parking area. (103 spaces = 11 trees and ground level plantings)	-	11 trees in parking area
Location	Shall be on the same lot as the	-	Parking area on Country Club property

	principal building or use that they serve.		
--	--	--	--

V = Bulk variance required

ENC = Existing Non-Conforming Condition

Electric Vehicle Parking Requirements			
	Ordinance Requirements	Existing	Proposed
Minimum Number of EV Spaces (§ 25-12.6d2)	Install at least four Make-Ready parking spaces, at least one of which shall be accessible for people with disabilities, if there will be 101 to 150 off-street parking spaces. (103 spaces)	2 EV Spaces	2 Standard EV Spaces <i>(Applicant to install two more spaces, one of which shall be ADA accessible)</i>
EV Space Signage	Publicly-accessible EVSE shall have posted regulatory signs, as identified in this section, allowing only charging electric vehicles to park in such spaces	-	Regulatory Signs

D. Lighting

- i. A total of six (6) different fixtures are proposed.
- ii. Fixtures A1 and A2 are part of the same double pole-mounted fixture, and six (6) units are proposed in the parking area and along the driveway at a mounting height of 18 ft.
- iii. Fixtures B1 and B2 are part of the same double pole-mounted fixture, and eight (8) units are proposed throughout the parking lot area at a mounting height of 18 ft.
- iv. Fixture C is another pole-mounted fixture, and one (1) is proposed in one of the parking area islands.
- v. Fixture D is a roadway area light fixture mounted on an existing utility pole. Seven (7) are proposed along Eagle Rock Avenue at a mounting height of 27 ft. ***This exceeds the permitted mounting height for lights, but, given that these lights are not on the property, we defer to the County to assess compliance.***

General Lighting Standards (§25-14.1)			
	Ordinance Requirements	Existing	Proposed
Shielding Of Fixtures	All lighting fixtures shall be directed downward and shall be equipped with the necessary shielding so as to prevent the direct	-	Acrylic panel lenses provide shielding

	source of light from being visible from any point beyond the property lines of the premises.		
Maximum Height of Fixtures	18 feet above normal grade	-	18ft for lights on the property 27 ft for Roadway Lights (defer to County)
Maximum Illumination Level at Property Line	0.5 FC at the property line 0.3 FC at any property line abutting residential use or zone	-	3.5 FC at property line at Eagle Rock Ave. entrance (V)
Duration Of Illumination	Provision shall be made for the reduction in the intensity of illumination to the minimum needed for security purposes when the facility is not in operation	-	<i>Applicant to provide testimony regarding compliance</i>
Underground Installation	All wiring for light fixtures shall be laid underground, and not strung between poles or buildings	-	<i>Applicant to confirm</i>

V = Bulk variance required W = Waiver Required

E. Signage

- i. Signage for this application includes traffic signs and parking signs, including EVSE signage, which are all permitted in this zone.

6. Statutory Criteria

Bulk/ "C" Relief:

- i. The applicant requires c-variance relief for this application. The applicant shall provide testimony that demonstrates how the request for relief may be granted based on one of the standards provided in the MLUL at N.J.S.A. 40:55D-70c. It is the applicant's responsibility to bear the burden of proof.
- ii. In order to satisfy the positive and negative criteria for each c variance enumerated above, the applicant should provide testimony that satisfies either the c(1) hardship criterion or c(2) flexible criterion as set forth in the MLUL.
 - a. Positive criteria: There are two types of c variances - the c(1) hardship and the c(2) flexible variance.

The *c(1) hardship* criteria states that a “hardship” will occur if the variance is not granted. The hardship relates to the physical or topographical features of the property and cannot relate to financial or personal hardship. Hardship relating to property can include:

- i. Narrowness, shallowness, or irregular shape
- ii. An exceptional topographic condition
- iii. Other unique conditions or features affecting the property

The *c(2) flexible variance* states that by granting the variance, the purposes of the MLUL would be advanced by a deviation from the zoning ordinance requirement and that the benefits of granting the variance substantially outweigh the detriments

- b. Negative criteria: The applicant must satisfy the two-prong test of the negative criteria;
 - i. The variance can be granted without substantial detriment to the public good;
and
 - ii. The variance can be granted without causing substantial detriment to the zone plan.

The applicant’s testimony regarding the negative criteria should address any potential impacts that the proposed variances may have on the neighborhood, as well as how the proposed development is consistent with, or in potential conflict with, both the zoning