
MEMORANDUM

To: *Chairman and Members of the
West Orange Zoning Board*

From: *Ryan MacNeill, PE
Zoning Board Engineer*



Date: *July 8, 2026*

Re: *Application No. ZB-25-07
Mavis Tire Supply, LLC
Preliminary & Final Site Plan with 'C' and 'D'
Variances and Tree Removal Permit - Review #4
460 Prospect Avenue
Block 105, Lot 64.01
Our File: 115.WRZ0105.V01 (60001)*

CC: *Geniece Gary-Adams – Director of Planning & Development/Zoning Official
Zayibeth Carballo, PE, PLS, PP, CME, CFM, CFS – Municipal Engineer
Christopher Dochney, PP, AICP – Zoning Board Planner
Steven Warner, Esq. – Zoning Board Attorney
Mavis Tire Supply, LLC - Applicant
Lisa A. John-Basta, Esq. – Applicant's Attorney
Rodman R. Ritchie, PE – Applicant's Engineer
Larson Design Group, Inc. – Applicant's Architect
Christine A. Nazzaro-Cofone, PP – Applicant's Planner*

Our office has received for review the following documents which were submitted in support of the above referenced application for Preliminary & Final Site Plan with 'C' and 'D' Variances:

- A set of unsigned architectural plans (4 sheets) prepared by Larson Design Group, Inc. of Cranberry Township, Pennsylvania dated February 12, 2026, last revised June 29, 2026;
- Mavis Tire Supply, LLC Rendering – Option B (2 sheets) prepared by Larson Design Group, Inc. of Cranberry Township, Pennsylvania dated June 29th, 2026, unrevised;
- A Traffic Impact Study prepared by Patrick Downey, PE, PTOE and Justin Taylor, PE, PTOE with Dynamic Traffic of Newtown, Pennsylvania dated July 21, 2025, last revised June 26, 2026;
- An Acoustic Analysis, prepared by Benjamin C. Mueller, PE with Ostergaard Acoustical Associates of Woodbridge, New Jersey dated June 28, 2026, unrevised;

In addition to the above, our office previously received the following information as part of the prior submissions for this application:

- A set of Preliminary and Final Site Plan drawings (19 sheets) prepared Rodman R. Ritchie, PE and Marla A. Roller, LLA with Dynamic Engineering of Marlton, New Jersey and bearing a latest revision date of April 27, 2026.

-
- A Stormwater Management, Water Quality and Groundwater Recharge Analysis prepared by Rodman R. Ritchie, PE, PP and bearing a latest revision date of May 2026. Included with the report is a set of Drainage and Inlet Area Maps (3 sheets) prepared by Dynamic Engineering dated July 16, 2025.
 - A Stormwater Management Operation and Maintenance Manual prepared by Rodman R. Ritchie, PE, PP and bearing a latest revision date of May 2026.
 - A print of an ALTA/NSPE Land Title Survey (1 sheet) prepared by James A. Conway Jr., PLS with Dynamic Survey, LLC of Newark, New Jersey and bearing a latest revision date of December 17, 2024.
 - A Geotechnical Engineering Report prepared by Stephen F. Patt, PE and Jeffrey C. Yates, PE with ECS Mid-Atlantic, LLC of Moorestown, New Jersey dated December 10, 2024.
 - Addendum No. 1 – Results of Test Pit Excavation and Infiltration Testing prepared by Jeffrey C. Yates, PE and Stephen F. Patt, PE with ECS Mid-Atlantic, LLC dated January 29, 2025.
 - A Tree Removal Report prepared by Michael LaLana, LTE and Marla A. Roller, LLA with Dynamic Engineering of Marlton, New dated March 2026.
 - A copy of a May 5, 2026 letter from Rodman R. Ritchie, PE and Andrew Haupin, PE to the West Orange Township Zoning Board which addresses the comments in our March 25, 2026 engineering review letter and the March 25, 2026 planning review letter from Christopher N. Dochney, PP.
 - A Consulting Report prepared by Christine A. Nazzaro-Cofone, PP with Cofone Consulting Group of Red Bank, New Jersey dated February 17, 2026.
 - A completed Application Form dated July 16, 2025.
 - A Disclosure of all entities and individuals having a ten percent (10%) or greater interest in Mavis Tire Supply LLC.
 - A completed Application for Tree Removal & Replacement Permit dated August 11, 2025.
 - A completed Township of West Orange Application for Stormwater Permit dated February 6, 2026.
 - A completed Site Plan/Subdivision Checklist.
 - A completed Sustainability Checklist Form.
 - A completed Grading Plan Design Items - Checklist.
 - A Preliminary List of Variances & Waivers prepared by Dynamic Engineering Consultants, PC dated February 2026
 - A July 9, 2025 Buffer Report from the Office of the Assessor which lists the properties within 200 ft of Block 105, Lot 64.01.
 - A copy of a July 8, 2025 Verification of Taxes & Sewer Charges Paid from the Office of the Tax Collector which states that the taxes are paid until July 31, 2025, the 2024 sewer charges have been paid and the 2025 sewer charges have not yet been billed.
 - Copies of various deed documents for the property in question.

-
- Copies of the following Zoning Board of Adjustment Resolutions of Approval for the property in question:
 - Zoning Board of Adjustment Case No. ZB 84-21 dated January 17, 1985.
 - Zoning Board of Adjustment Case No. ZB 84-21 dated February 14, 1985.
 - Zoning Board of Adjustment Case No. ZB 02-27 dated October 17, 2002.

We have reviewed the submitted information and offer the following comments:

A. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The property in question is a rectangular tract which fronts on the easterly side of Prospect Avenue approximately 826 ft north of the intersection with Marcella Avenue. It has an area of 32,118 sf or approximately 0.74 acres and is located in the B-2 Zoning District. The property is currently occupied by a 3,334 sf 2-story office building which has been used as a realtor's office. According to the Resolution of Approval for Case No. ZB-02-27, 19 parking spaces were approved in front of the building and an additional 10 parking spaces at the southerly end of the property.

The Applicant is seeking Preliminary & Final Site Plan approval with 'C' and 'D' variances and a Tree Removal Permit to demolish the existing structure and pavement and to construct a new 6,205 sf automotive service facility with 7 service bays and a 1,142 sf retail sales area including a showroom, sales counter, waiting area and restrooms. On-site parking is proposed for 22 vehicles including 2 handicap accessible parking spaces. Access is proposed to the site via a right in/ right out two-way driveway from Prospect Avenue. In addition, a full movement driveway is proposed on the southerly side of the site which will connect to Blueberry Bend which is a private road. The Applicant proposes an underground detention basin and a bioretention basin to mitigate the increase in runoff from the site. The overflow from these basins and the stormwater runoff from the undetained portions of the site will be collected and discharged to an existing 15" pipe which exits the property at the northeast corner of the site.

Based on comments received at the May 28, 2026 Zoning Board of Adjustment hearing, the Applicant modified the proposed rooftop plan and parapet.

B. DESIGN COMMENTS

1. Based on our review, we find that the following items from the Township's Site Plan/Subdivision Checklist must be addressed:
 - a) Item #14 – *Affidavit of ownership.*

In their May 5, 2026 letter, Messrs. Ritchie and Haupin state that a copy of the Affidavit of Ownership was submitted in the August 20, 2025 submission and an additional copy will be submitted to the Board by the Applicant's Attorney.
2. The Applicant has requested the following waivers in support of this application:
 - a) From the requirement to provide a minimum illumination level of 2.0 FC for the parking areas.
 - b) From the requirement to provide road and paving cross-sections and profiles (Checklist Item #41).
 - c) From the requirement to provide proposed street names (Checklist Item #42).
 - d) The Applicant proposes to comply with the West Orange COAH Ordinance as a condition of approval.
3. The Applicant should address the Board regarding the proposed hours of operation of the Mavis Tire Center.

-
4. The Applicant should address the Board regarding their plans to provide a loading space as required by §25-12.3 of the Township Code.
 5. It states on sheet 5 that Prospect Avenue has a variable ROW width. In their May 5, 2026 letter, Messrs. Ritchie and Haupin state that they have determined that the existing right-of-way width and right-of-way half-width in front of the site are 108 ft and 54 ft respectively. Therefore, the plans must be revised to depict this information. In addition, they further state that they are in receipt of email correspondence from Essex County that a ROW dedication, easement or reservation will not be required as a condition of approval for this project. Therefore, a copy of the email correspondence from Essex County must be submitted to the Zoning Board and our office.
 6. It shows on sheet 5 that the Applicant proposes a driveway connection to Blueberry Bend which is a private road. The Applicant must demonstrate that they have the necessary approval from the Owner of Blueberry Bend to permit the proposed driveway connection. In their May 5, 2026 letter, Messrs. Ritchie and Haupin state that testimony regarding the driveway connection will be provided at the Zoning Board hearing.
 7. According to our notes, at the Site Plan Review Advisory Board (SPRAB) meeting on November 18, 2025 the Applicant agreed to provide a privacy fence along the rear property line. It shows on the plans that the Applicant proposes to construct a 15 ft long, 6 ft high solid wooded privacy fence from the southeast corner of the building to the masonry trash enclosure. In their May 5, 2026 letter, Messrs. Ritchie and Haupin state that a significant portion of the existing landscaping between the proposed development and the neighboring property to the east will remain, providing additional buffer between the uses. The Applicant should address the Board regarding the reasons why a privacy fence has not been provided along the rear property line.
 8. It shows on sheet 5 that a 10'x10' masonry trash enclosure is proposed at the southeast corner of the building. The Applicant should provide testimony to the Board to demonstrate that the proposed trash enclosure will have adequate capacity to accommodate the trash and recyclables that will be generated at the site.
 9. It shows on sheet 5 that the proposed trash enclosure will be located close to the rear property line. We note that the property in question abuts an existing residential neighborhood. The Applicant should address the Board regarding the anticipated frequency and hours of pickup. Our office is concerned with the potential noise impacts on the adjoining residential properties.
 10. Sheet 5 should be revised to label the proposed detectable warning surfaces.
 11. It shows on sheet 7 that the Applicant proposes to install a new 6" DIP sewer lateral which will connect to an existing 6" cast iron sewer line. However, the condition of the existing 6" cast iron sewer line is not known. In their May 5, 2026 letter, Messrs. Ritchie and Haupin state that the Applicant is in the process of having the existing cast iron sewer lateral televised to the point of connection to the existing sewer main, and a summary of findings will be provided as a condition of approval.

C. STORMWATER MANAGEMENT COMMENTS

1. On May 20, 2025, the Township of West Orange adopted Ordinance 2918-25 which amended the Township's Stormwater Control Ordinance (SCO). This Ordinance defines a major development as one which individually or collectively results in:
 - a. The disturbance of 0.5 acre of land since February 2, 2004.
 - b. The creation of 5,000 square feet or more of "regulated impervious surface" since February 2, 2004.

-
- c. The creation of 5,000 square feet or more of “regulated motor vehicle surface” since March 2, 2021, or
 - d. A combination of b and c above that totals 5,000 square feet or more. The same surface shall not be counted twice when determining if the combination area equals one-quarter acre or more.

It shows on sheet 12 that the area of disturbance will be 32,434 sf or 0.74 acres. As a result, this project is classified as a major development and must comply with the requirements in Ordinance 2918-25.

- 2. The Applicant proposes an underground detention basin and a bioretention basin to mitigate the increase in runoff from the site. The overflow from these basins and the stormwater runoff from the undetained portions of the site will be collected and discharged to an existing 15” pipe which exits the property at the northeast corner of the site.
- 3. The Applicant proposes to have the roof runoff discharge to the underground detention basin. It states in Chapter 11.2 of the New Jersey Stormwater Best Management Practices Manual that an extended detention basin (Non-GI) can only be used to address the stormwater runoff quantity control aspects of the development when a waiver or variance is obtained from N.J.A.C. 7:8-5.3 as it is not considered to be green infrastructure. Therefore, the Applicant requires, and has requested, a waiver from §25-29.4p (green infrastructure standards) of the Ordinance. The Applicant should provide testimony to the Board setting forth the reasons why the requested waiver should be granted.
- 4. The Point of Analysis #1 table on page 8 shows that the proposed peak flow rate will be reduced for each storm event. However, it remains for the Applicant to demonstrate that the post-construction runoff hydrographs for the current and projected 2 year, 10 year and 100 year storm events will not exceed, at any point in time, the pre-construction hydrographs for the same storm events. The Applicant has requested a waiver from strict compliance with this requirement. The Applicant should provide testimony to the Board setting forth the reasons why the requested waiver should be granted.
- 5. The Point of Analysis #2 table on page 8 must be revised to show that the proposed peak flow rate for the current 10-year storm will be 0.20 cfs, not 0.24 cfs as currently shown.
- 6. As stipulated in §25-29.12b7(d), the party responsible for maintenance of the site’s stormwater system must post a two-year maintenance guarantee in accordance with N.J.S.A. 49:55D-53.
- 7. The stormwater management operation and maintenance manual and any future revisions must be recorded upon the deed of record for the property. Prior to recording, the form of the deed must be approved by the Board Attorney and our office.
- 8. The Drainage & Utility Plan (sheet 7) shows an existing manhole at the southeast corner of the site which could not be opened. The plans must be revised to clarify the purpose of this manhole and to show any associated piping. In their May 5, 2026 letter, Messrs. Ritchie and Haupin state that the project surveyor is scheduled to revisit the site on May 5, 2026 to attempt to open the existing manhole and identify its purpose and any associated piping. They further state that a report summarizing their findings will be provided as a condition of approval.
- 9. It remains for the Bioretention System Detail on sheet 15 to be revised to provide specifications for the soil planting bed which complies with Chapter 9.7 of NJ BMP manual.
- 10. It shows on the 48” HDPE Schematic Underground Basin Detail on sheet 16 that the bottom of basin elevation will be 617.25. In addition, it shows on sheet 7 that the pipe invert will be at elevation 617.75. We note that the 48” HDPE Schematic Underground Basin Detail requires a minimum separation of 6” from the bottom of the basin to the bottom of the pipe. based on the invert elevation

shown, a separation of 6" will be provided from the pipe invert to the basin bottom, not from the bottom of the pipe to the basin bottom. This discrepancy must be resolved.

D. LANDSCAPING COMMENTS

1. As recommended in our March 25, 2026 review letter, an oak tree should be provided at the northeast corner of the site in maintain the same quantity of street trees. In addition, the oaks should be in the white oak family due to bacterial leaf scorch (BLS).

E. LIGHTING COMMENTS

1. The plans have been revised to propose timers for the light fixtures. The proposed hours of operation for the lights should be indicated on the plans. Our office recommends that light levels be reduced or turned off 1 hour after the close of work to reduce light pollution.

The Applicant is hereby advised that any revised plans or other documents submitted to the Board should be accompanied by a cover letter which addresses each of the comments in this review letter and also details any other changes that have been made to the plans as these may not be readily apparent.

H:\Legacy\Howell-FS1\SEC\West Orange\Zoning Board\115.WRZ0105.V01 - Mavis Tire Supply, LLC\26-07-08 Review #4.docx