TOWNSHIP OF WEST ORANGE
DEPARTMENT OF ENGINEERING

25 LAKESIDE AVENUE, WEST ORANGE, N.J. 07052

ZAYIBETH CARBALLO
Director/ Municipal Engineer

Tel/Fax: (973) 325-4160

Email: engineering@westorange.org

MEMORANDUM #4

TO: **ZONING BOARD MEMBERS**

FROM: **ZAYIBETH CARBALLO, P.E., P.L.S., P.P, CME, CFM**
DIRECTOR/MUNICIPAL ENGINEER

DATE: **NOVEMBER 6, 2026**

SUBJECT: **APPLICATION SUBMISSION – C2 VARIANCE**
FOR GARAGE IMPROVEMENTS
ZB-26-01
15 ALAN STREET
BLOCK 146, LOT 72

We are in receipt of the following information pertaining to the above-referenced application:

A. Township's Board Application and associated documents;

B. Color comparison rendering of Proposed Garage vs. Existing Garage;

C. 3D Renderings of garage showing front and side views;

D. Survey entitled "Map of Property Situated in Township of West Orange, Essex County, NJ" survey prepared for Max Grossman. The survey prepared by Richard J. Hingos, Inc. Professional Land Surveyors (Richard J. Hingos, Jr. P.L.S.) are dated November 19, 2018; and

E. Structural plans entitled, "Garage Expansion at West Orange, NJ." Plans prepared by Yogi Engineering through consultant Seva Engineering (Sanjay N. Patel) are dated February 27, 2026.

The following information was submitted on May 6, 2026 in addition to the previously provided information:

F. Soil Movement Calculation and Soil Erosion and Sediment Control Plan Document, dated May 4, 2026;

G. Tree Protection Plan Document, Dated April 26, 2026;

H. Garage Expansion Plan, prepared by Max Grossman, last dated May 6,2026;

I. Proposal Narrative; and

J. Revised Variance Application

The following information was submitted on July 28, 2026 in addition to the previously provided information:

K. Planning Evaluation, prepared by Peter G. Steck P.P., dated July 18, 2026

L. Revised Variance Application, last dated July 19, 2026

The following information was submitted on November 4, 2026 in addition to the previously provided information:

M. Site Plan, entitled "Garage Expansion Plan, 15 Alan Street, West Orange, NJ 07052", prepared by Richard B. Vollmar P.E. of Blue Line Stone Home & Engineering, dated October 26, 2026;

N. Response correspondence, prepared by Richard B. Vollmar P.E., P.P., C.M.E. of Blue Line Stone Home & Engineering, dated October 27, 2026.

I. INTRODUCTION

The subject site is located along the Northern side of Alan Street and located with the Township's Residential (R-T) Zone District. The Applicant is proposing to modify the existing garage located at the north westerly corner of the property to accommodate the size of modern vehicles and family needs.

II. ZONING

The proposed additions to the existing garage will increase the height by ±5 feet surpassing the maximum allowable height of 15 feet for an accessory structure. As per ordinance 25-8.1(f), accessory buildings in residential zones should not exceed 15 feet in height. This proposal does not meet the requirements noted above, the Applicant must seek relief from the Board purusant to the Municipal Land Use Law under N.J.S.A. 40-55D-70c.

"C(2)" Bulk Variance "Benefits versus Detriments"

(1) Relief is applicable to 'Property Specific'

(2) Municipal Land Use Law would be advanced

(3) No substantial detriment to the Public Good

(4) Benefits substantially outweigh the detriments of the public good

(5) Will not impair the intent and purpose of the Zone Plan and Ordinances

III. PROPOSAL

The proposal is to increase the current 18.5-foot by 18.5-foot garage to an 18.5-foot by 27-foot garage to accommodate for a modern sized pickup truck. The extensions of the garage will not be increasing impervious coverage as it will be extended over the driveway's current coverage. The garage height will also increase from ±15.5 feet to 20.5 feet for a second floor which will be used as a woodworking studio with proper insulation to deter excessive noise pollution from machine operation.

IV. TREE REMOVAL

4.1 Testimony by the Applicant's professional needs to be provided confirming that no trees are to be removed due to the improvements to the garage;

Addressed. The Applicant has provided a Tree Protection Plan document and has stated that; "No trees on the subject property are proposed for removal as part of this application." Testimony by the Applicant is still recommended regarding the removal of trees.

4.2 Tree protection plan needs to be provided for adjacent trees that might belong to neighboring properties and might impacted by construction;

Addressed. The Applicant has provided a Tree Protection Plan document and has stated that; the "tree's canopy is sufficiently high above grade that no canopy trimming is required to accommodate construction", "there is no scenario in which construction activity on the subject property will come into contact with the trunk", and "should any unforeseen condition arise during construction that could affect the tree, the owner will notify the neighbor and the Township engineer

prior to taking further action in that area."

4.3 A tree protection fence needs to be installed out to the dripline of any trees to protect root system during construction;

Addressed. The tree protection location and detail have been provided on the site plan

4.4 A tree replacement plan needs to be provided for any trees to be removed and a Letter by a Certified Tree Expert needs to be submitted stating the reasons for the tree(s) removal;

Addressed. The Applicant does not propose the removal of any trees.

4.5 Testimony should be provided indicating how the existing trees will be saved considering the proposed grading alterations.

Addressed. The Applicant's Professional has stated that there are no grading alterations and existing trees will be unaffected. The Applicant's Professional has stated that testimony will be provided.

V. PROPOSED GARAGE

5.1 A note referencing the existing survey needs to be provided on the rendering plans in accordance with N.J.A.C. 13:40-7.2.;

Addressed.

5.2 The 3D renderings with side view submitted will need to be a part of the plan set;

Partially Addressed. The Applicant's Professional has stated that the 3D renderings have been included with the revised submission. The renderings were not included in the additional documents provided to the Department of Engineering.

5.3 Signature blocks for the Board Engineer, Chairman and Secretary need to be added to the plans;

Addressed.

5.4 A table showing the schedule of requirements should be provided;

Addressed.

5.5 Make sure to show the locations of the roof leaders and point of discharge on the ground including how these will tie into any existing pipes and provide associated pipe sizes, lengths and slopes;

Addressed. The Applicant proposes to maintain the existing discharge locations of the existing garage. The Applicant should provide testimony addressing adherence to this.

5.6 Roof overhangs should be dimensioned to ensure it does not project more than 2 feet as per ordinance 25-8.2(c). Otherwise, a variance shall be required for any feature that projects more than two feet into a required yard;

Partially Addressed. The Applicant's Professional has stated testimony will be provided.

5.7 Testimony should be provided by Applicant's professional to clarify that the location of the roof leaders on the ground will not adversely affect adjoining property owners;

Addressed. A plan has been provided indicating the locations of the proposed roof leaders. Additionally, a note on the plan states, "No adjoining neighbors will be adversely affected by relocated roof leader."

5.8 Testimony should be provided by Applicant's professional to confirm that the garage improvements are is within the 0 to 10% slope range that allows 100% disturbance. Refer to section 25-28 of the Township's ordinance;

Partially Addressed. A topographic survey was conducted; the contour lines and elevation data have been added to the plan. A note has been included on the plan stating the proposed improvements are in accordance with slope and disturbance thresholds in Section 25-28 of the Township Ordinance. The Applicant's Professional shall provide further testimony confirming that the proposed improvements are within the 0 to 10% slope range.

5.9 A soil erosion and sediment control plan with details needs to be provided and show the area of disturbance;

Addressed. The plan provided includes soil erosion and sediment control (SESC) details. The Applicant's Professional states that the approximate limit of disturbance is approximately 200 SF and is below the threshold for SESC permitting.

5.10 Provide soil movement calculations for the proposed improvements within the limit of disturbance. A soil removal permit will be required if more than 300 CY of soil will need to be moved;

Addressed. Soil Movement Calculations are included on the plan. The Applicant's Professional has stated that a total of 9 CY will be removed. The Applicant is herein advised that all soil shall be exported off-site.

5.11 The proposed garage improvements do not increase impervious coverage. Therefore, stormwater measures are not required for this application;

5.12 Prior to commencing construction activities, soil erosion and sediment control measures must be in place and maintain until the disturbed ground is permanently stabilized;

Addressed. The Applicant has provided narrative acknowledging this. The Applicant shall provide testimony of same.

5.13 A note should be added to the plans that all disturbed areas are to be restored, topsoiled and seeded;

Addressed.

5.14 A Certification stating that the garage improvements were constructed according to the design is to be submitted by the Applicant's professional; and

Not Addressed. The Applicant shall provide testimony acknowledging the requirement of Certification that the garage improvements were constructed according the design submitted by the Applicant's professional.

5.15 We recommend an "As-Built Topographic Plan" be submitted prior to the issuance of a certificate of occupancy;

Not Addressed. The Applicant shall provide testimony acknowledging the submission of an "As-Built Topographic Plan".

VI. PERMITS

6.1 Should the Board approve this application:

6.1.1 Certification from Hudson-Essex-Passaic Soil Conservation District will be required if more than 5,000 SF

6.1.2 A Street opening permit is required for any work within the ROW.

6.1.3. A tree removal application and permit will be required from the Township forester if any trees need to be removed.

6.1.4 As- Built Topographic Plan is to be submitted to the Departments of Building and Engineering

ZC/jrm