

**RESOLUTION
of the
PLANNING BOARD OF THE TOWNSHIP OF WEST ORANGE**

Heard: October 6, 2021

Adopted: November 3, 2021

Township of West Orange Historic Preservation Commission Presentation: Proposed Designation of
Certain Properties as Historic Landmarks

WHEREAS, pursuant to the New Jersey Municipal Land Use Law (MLUL) N.J.S.A. Section 40:55D-109 and Section 25-30 of the Revised Ordinances of the Township of West Orange, the Township of West Orange Historic Preservation Commission (the "Commission") has undertaken the survey and study of certain properties within the Township of West Orange (the "Township") in order to properly identify such properties that meet the statutory criteria for designation as a Historic Landmark; and

WHEREAS, following the statutory procedure provided in Revised General Ordinances, Section 25-30 as well as the above-cited Section of the MLUL, the Commission retained the services of Hunter Research, Inc. and Eryn Boyce, M.S. Architectural Historian and Patrick Harshbarger, M.A., M.P.A., Principal Historian/Architectural Historian who conducted in-depth studies and research reports, (the "Report") (Enclosed Hereto as EXHIBIT A) on the following properties: Holy Trinity Episcopal Church, 315 Main Street; State Diner, 567 South Valley Road; Williams/McManus/Lehmann House, 122 Main Street; Hedges Block, 56 Main Street (hardware store;) George V. Hecker Carriage House, 36 Ridge Road (the "Subject Properties"); and

WHEREAS, copies of the Report were posted on the Township website, and printed copies were placed in the West Orange Public Library. To seek public input regarding the Commission's intention to nominate these properties as Local Historic Landmarks, the Report was presented to the public at a properly noticed virtual meeting on July 21, 2021; and

WHEREAS, at the conclusion of the Historic Preservation Commission's July 21, 2021 public meeting, Members of the Commission considered the contents of the Report and then voted

to support the Report's conclusions as to the designation of the five Subject Properties as Historic Landmarks according to the statutory criteria and to send the recommendations and conclusions forward to the Planning Board for its consideration; and

WHEREAS, at its properly noticed Regular Meeting held on October 6, 2021, the Planning Board reviewed and considered the Report and heard sworn testimony from Brian Feeney and Martin Feitlowitz, the Chair and Vice-Chair of the Historic Preservation Commission;

WHEREAS, the Board also heard sworn testimony from the primary author of the Report, Patrick Harshbarger, M.A., M.P.A., Principal Historian/Architectural Historian; and

WHEREAS, the Board considered the opinions of its professional staff and also provided for public comment on the Report; and

WHEREAS, having heard the presentations and having performed its review pursuant to N.J.S.A. Section 40:55D-109 and Section 25-30 of the Revised Ordinances of the Township of West Orange, the Board hereby makes the following findings of fact and conclusions of law:

1. The Board accepted into evidence the following Documents:

SUBMISSION ITEM	SIGNED BY	DATE/REVISI
Memorandum	Brian Feeney, Chair, Township of West Orange Historic Preservation Commission	9/27/21
Powerpoint Slide Presentation	Hunter Research, Patrick Harshbarger, M.A., M.P.A., Principal Historian/Architectural Historian	October 2021
Report(s)	Hunter Research, Patrick Harshbarger, M.A., M.P.A., Principal Historian/Architectural Historian & Eryn Boyce, M.S. Architectural Historian	October 2019, September – November, 2019; November 2020

2. Patrick Harshbarger, M.A., M.P.A., Principal Historian/Architectural, Hunter Research, presented the findings and conclusions of the Report to the Board and also presented the above-referenced PowerPoint presentation to the Board which summarized the Report's findings and provided pictographic evidence with respect to the Subject Properties.

3. The 2010 Master Plan Update lists the following General Objective: "Promote the Preservation of Historic Structures and Places". As noted on Page 9 of the Township of West Orange 2019 Master Plan Update, this General Objective remains valid.

4. West Orange is home to a number of historic buildings and properties, with a rich heritage including historical figures and notable events. The Township's history is preserved through local landmarks and documented in the local history collection housed in the West Orange Public Library. The West Orange Historic Preservation Commission plays a key role in these efforts through actions such as reviewing applications for development impacting historic landmarks and updating the Township's survey of historic resources, through funding provided by the State.

5. Page 44 of the 2019 Master Plan update features the following recommendations:

- The Historic Preservation Commission should be better promoted within the Township.
- Consider designating additional local landmarks.
- Continue updating the survey of historic resources, as it needs to be updated regularly for West Orange to remain a Certified Local Government, which impacts eligibility for funding from the State.
- Emphasize the sustainability and community character benefits of reuse of historic and other older buildings.

6. During a historic sites survey of the Main Street corridor completed for the West Orange Historic Preservation Commission in 2014, Holy Trinity Episcopal Church at 315 Main Street (Block 125.05, Lot 1) was identified as excellent example of ecclesiastical architecture that makes use of hollow structural clay tile, or terra cotta blocks, as a building material. Per the Township of West Orange Revised General Ordinances 25-30.3, "Historic District and Landmark

Designation,” the West Orange Historic Preservation Commission retained the services of Hunter Research, Inc. in 2019 to conduct an in-depth study of Holy Trinity Episcopal Church and its history with the goal of designating it as a Local Historic Landmark. This Landmark Designation Report presents the results of this study and was prepared to support the West Orange Historic Preservation Commission’s recommendation that the Master Plan and Zoning Map of the Township of West Orange be amended to designate the Holy Trinity Episcopal Church as a Local Historic Landmark. This is the first step in the local landmark designation process outlined by Township of West Orange Revised General Ordinances 25-30.3.

7. The definitions and procedures for local designation of historic landmarks and districts in the Township of West Orange are contained in Chapter 25-30 of the township’s ordinances. Specifically, the National Register Criteria for designation are incorporated by reference in subsection 25-30.3(b).³⁵ The National Register Criteria for eligibility are described by the U.S. Department of the Interior, National Register Program in 36 CFR 60.4: “The quality of significance in American history, architecture, archaeology, engineering, and culture is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures and objects that possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association, and: A. that are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or B. that are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or C. that embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or D. that have yielded, or may be likely to yield information important in prehistory or history.

8. Designed by Hobart Brown Upjohn in 1907, **Holy Trinity Episcopal Church** is an early example of the Tudor Revival style, which reached peak popularity during the 1920s and 1930s. With its white stuccoed exterior, steeply-pitched gable roof, half timbering and leaded diamond-pattern stained glass windows, Holy Trinity Episcopal Church embodies the character-defining features of the Tudor Revival style. Hobart Upjohn carried the Tudor Revival style through to the interior, which features exposed timber arches and roof framing, wood floors, an elaborately carved wood choir with medieval motifs and stained glass windows patterned to mimic pointed arches. The grandson of Richard Upjohn and the son of Richard M. Upjohn, Hobart Brown Upjohn became a prominent architect in his own right during his 40 year career and was widely regarded as an expert in ecclesiastical and educational architecture. While the use of hollow structural clay blocks in the construction of load-bearing walls became common during the first decade of the 20th century, the congregation's decision to employ hollow structural clay blocks and to build Holy Trinity Episcopal Church entirely with volunteer labor demonstrates the adaptability and practicality of this building technique. In short, Holy Trinity Episcopal Church represents a unique combination of architect design and vernacular construction. As such, Holy Trinity Episcopal Church is eligible for listing as a local landmark under **Criterion C**.

9. While the exterior has experienced some minor alterations, most notably the replacement asphalt-shingle roof, unoriginal storm windows and replacement vinyl windows at the basement level, Holy Trinity Episcopal Church retains high integrity of design, exterior and interior materials and workmanship. It is judged to have a period of significance of 1907, when it was designed and constructed. The parsonage and garage, which were constructed between 1924 and 1932, and the 1954 community center are considered non-contributing buildings. They post-date the period of significance of the church and contrast sharply in style and materials with the

Tudor Revival style church. The parsonage and garage represent architecturally undistinguished examples of the Colonial Revival style, while the community center lacks any architectural distinguishing Page 10 features. In addition, the parsonage has diminished integrity of materials and workmanship due to the replacement of most of the windows and the doors.

10. During a historic sites survey of the area known as the Lower Gregory Neighborhood completed for the West Orange Historic Preservation Commission in 2016, the State Diner at 567 South Valley Road (Block 28, Lot 23) was identified as an excellent example of post-World War II diner architecture (Figure 1). The West Orange Historic Preservation Commission retained the services of Hunter Research, Inc. in 2019 to conduct an in-depth study of the State Diner and its history with the goal of designating it as a Local Historic Landmark per the Township of West Orange Revised General Ordinances 25-30.3, “Historic District and Landmark Designation”. This Landmark Designation Report presents the results of this study and was prepared to support the West Orange Historic Preservation Commission’s decision on whether to recommend that the Master Plan and Zoning Map of the Township of West Orange be amended to designate the State Diner as a Local Historic Landmark. This is the first step in the local landmark designation process outlined by Township of West Orange Revised General Ordinances 25-30.3.

11. The **State Diner** is judged to be eligible for listing as a local landmark under **Criterion A** for its association with the pattern of events that transformed New Jersey into the “Diner Capital of America” during the 20th century. Owned and operated by Italian immigrants and a second generation Italian American between 1928 and 1969, the State Diner is representative of how diner ownership, with its low capital investment, enabled immigrants and working-class Americans to become successful independent business owners and to achieve the

American dream. Designed and constructed by the Kullman Dining Car Company circa 1947, the State Diner embodies the character-defining features of the post-World War II, streamline Art Moderne diner property type. It is rectangular in shape with a flat roof and a substantial masonry foundation and features a streamlined exterior comprised of patterned stainless steel panels inlaid with painted metal trim and rounded corners with curvilinear glass windows. The interior is defined by the counter that runs the length of the diner and separates the area for food preparation from the public space for customers. Characteristic of post-World War II Art Moderne diners, the State Diner interior finishes include a Formica countertop, Formica tables, fixed stainless steel stools, Formica wall and ceiling panels, stainless steel backbar panels impressed with a sunburst pattern, stainless steel appliances, stainless steel trim and a tile floor. As such, the State Diner is also eligible for listing as a local landmark under Criterion C. Apart from the signs below the roof on the side (north and south) elevations, the State Diner has remained largely unaltered since its construction circa 1947. In short, the State Diner retains all aspects of historical integrity, including design, exterior and interior materials and workmanship. It is judged to have a period of significance from its construction circa 1947 to 1969, when the Lombritto family sold it to new owners. The circa 1930 garage that shares the lot with the State Diner is considered a non-contributing building. It pre-dates the period of significance of the diner and has no direct associations with the diner's purpose or function as an eating establishment. The garage has diminished integrity of materials and workmanship due to the replacement of garage doors and modern vinyl siding, and no architecturally distinguishing features.

12. During a historic sites survey of the Main Street corridor completed for the West Orange Historic Preservation Commission in 2014, the Hedges Block at 56 Main Street (Block 69, Lot 28) was identified as an excellent example of late-19th-century vernacular commercial

architecture. The building, constructed in 1892, is one of the oldest and most complete historic commercial buildings on West Orange’s Main Street and housed meeting space for West Orange’s municipal government until 1905, which adds to its historical significance. In 2019 the West Orange Historic Preservation Commission retained the services of Hunter Research, Inc., to conduct an in-depth historical study of the Hedges Block with the goal of designating it as a Local Historic Landmark per the Township of West Orange Revised General Ordinances 25-30.3, “Historic District and Landmark Designation.” This Landmark Designation Report presents the results of this study and was prepared to support the West Orange Historic Preservation Commission’s decision on whether to recommend that the Master Plan and Zoning Map of the Township of West Orange be amended to designate the Hedges Block as a Local Historic Landmark. This is the first step in the local landmark designation process outlined by Township of West Orange Revised General Ordinances 25-30.3. The property (Block 69, Lot 28) also includes a row of six one-story stores designated as 46-54 Main Street and located immediately adjacent to the Hedges Block. This designation report excludes 46-54 Main Street and focuses exclusively on the Hedges Block at 56 Main Street.

13. Constructed in 1892 by Samuel M. Hedges and Charles H. Hedges, the **Hedges Block at 56 Main Street** is one of the oldest and most well-preserved commercial buildings in West Orange’s Main Street corridor. It embodies the character-defining features of late-19th-century vernacular commercial architecture and is representative of the multi-use building type that defines the Main Street corridor. It is rectangular in form with a parapeted flat roof above a dentiled and modillioned wood cornice. Characteristic of late-19th and early-20th-century commercial buildings, the Hedges Block housed multiple functions under one roof. It featured two full-length storefronts with fixed plate glass windows at the first story topped by office space

and meeting rooms with double-hung windows on the second and third floors. The loading dock at the first story on the side (north) elevation and the faded advertising on the side (north and south) elevations speak to the building's continuous and varied commercial uses and its prominent location at the corner of Main Street and Lindsley Avenue. As such, it is deemed to be eligible for listing as a local landmark under **Criterion C**. While exterior alterations, most notably the replacement vinyl windows and 20th-century storefronts, have negatively impacted integrity of materials and workmanship, the Hedges Block retains its original design as expressed by scale and massing, fenestration pattern, running-bond and common-bond brick exterior, decorative wood cornices, stone window sills and lintels and first-story loading dock. As such, the Hedges Block possesses high integrity of design and retains sufficient integrity of materials and workmanship to convey its historic significance as a late 19th-century commercial building. The Hedges Block is deemed to have a period of significance of 1892, when it was designed and constructed. The adjacent one-story stores at 46 to 54 Main Street are deemed to be non-contributing because they were constructed as additions to the Hedges Block between 1911 and 1939 after the period of significance.

14. During a historic sites survey of the Main Street corridor completed for the West Orange Historic Preservation Commission in 2014, the Williams/McManus/Lehmann House at 122 Main Street (Block 89, Lot 36) was identified as an excellent example of Queen Anne-style domestic architecture and for its association with Llewellyn Park, a nationally significant suburban development. Per the Township of West Orange Revised General Ordinances 25-30.3, "Historic District and Landmark Designation," the West Orange Historic Preservation Commission retained the services of Hunter Research, Inc. in 2019 to conduct an in-depth study of the Williams/McManus/Lehmann House and its history with the goal of designating it as a

Local Historic Landmark. This Landmark Designation Report presents the results of this study and was prepared to support the West Orange Historic Preservation Commission's recommendation that the Master Plan and Zoning Map of the Township of West Orange be amended to designate the Williams/McManus/Lehmann House as a Local Historic Landmark. This is the first step in the local landmark designation process outlined by Township of West Orange Revised General Ordinances 25-30.3.

15. The **Williams/McManus/Lehmann House** is architecturally significant as a representative example of the Queen Anne style. With its asymmetrical plan and massing, hip-on-cross gabled roof, tower, wood clapboard exterior, varied fenestration pattern and wraparound front porch, the dwelling embodies the character-defining features of the Queen Anne style. The house's architectural history is made more complex by its incorporation of a mid-19th-century revival style house of 1856-1857, which dates to the very formative period of Llewellyn Park. The house's architectural history parallels the development of Llewellyn Park, which began in the picturesque style of Andrew Jackson Downing and Andrew Jackson Davis, and then by the later 19th century had moved toward the larger and more ornate architectural tastes of the Gilded Age. The smaller Italianate-style house of 1856-1857 was rather handily remodeled and expanded into a Queen Anne-style manse in 1895-1896. As such, the Williams/McManus/Lehmann House is deemed to be eligible for listing as a local landmark under **Criterion C** for architectural distinction and under Criterion A for its historic association with the development of Llewellyn Park. The Williams/McManus/Lehmann House possesses high integrity of design, exterior materials and workmanship to the period of circa 1895-1900. Although the dwelling was originally constructed in 1856-1857, it was remodeled to its current appearance circa 1895-1900. Integrity of setting, location, feeling and association are also present. The Williams/McManus/Lehmann House is

deemed to have a period of significance of 1856-1857, when the dwelling was constructed, to circa 1900, when it reached its current appearance.

16. During a historic sites survey of the Township of West Orange completed in 1991-1992, the George V. Hecker Carriage House at 36 Ridge Road (Block 80.05, Lot 40.02) was identified as an excellent example of Stick-style architecture and for its association with the historic Mountain Ridge neighborhood. . Per the Township of West Orange Revised General Ordinances 25-30.3, “Historic District and Landmark Designation,” the West Orange Historic Preservation Commission retained the services of Hunter Research, Inc. in 2020 to conduct an in-depth study of the George V. Hecker Carriage House and its history with the goal of designating it as a Local Historic Landmark. This Landmark Designation Report presents the results of this study and was prepared to support the West Orange Historic Preservation Commission’s recommendation that the Master Plan and Zoning Map of the Township of West Orange be amended to designate the George V. Hecker Carriage House as a Local Historic Landmark. This is the first step in the local landmark designation process outlined by Township of West Orange Revised General Ordinances 25-30.3.

17. During the meeting, the Board was informed by the Township's Zoning Official that the Township has issued a Summons to the property owner of the George V. Hecker Carriage House at 36 Ridge Road (Block 80.05, Lot 40.02) related to the maintenance of the exterior of the structure.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE PLANNING BOARD OF THE TOWNSHIP OF WEST ORANGE that the Board finds that the following properties meet the following statutory criteria for designation as Historic Landmarks pursuant to N.J.S.A. Section

40:55D-109 and the National Register Criteria for designation as incorporated by reference in subsection 25-30.3(b).35 of the Revised Ordinances of the Township of West Orange:

- Holy Trinity Episcopal Church at 315 Main Street (Block 125.05, Lot 1) – Criterion C- embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.
- State Diner at 567 South Valley Road (Block 28, Lot 23)- Criterion A- associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.
- Hedges Block at 56 Main Street (Block 69, Lot 28- Criterion C- embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.
- Williams/McManus/Lehmann House at 122 Main Street (Block 89, Lot 36)- Criterion C- embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, relative to the property known as the George V. Hecker Carriage House at 36 Ridge Road (Block 80.05, Lot 40.02), that at this time the Board determines that it is in the best interest of the Township and the public from a Planning perspective that the Board forego making a determination on the applicability of the statutory criteria as to this particular property until such time that the property owner resolves the aforementioned Summons issued by the Township.

Vote on Action by the Board at Regular Public Meeting on October 6, 2021:

BOARD MEMBER	MOTION	SECOND	AYE	NAY	ABSTAIN	ABSENT
Bagoff (Ch.)	X		X			
Guarino		X	X			
Smeraldo			X			
Klein						X

BOARD MEMBER	MOTION	SECOND	AYE	NAY	ABSTAIN	ABSENT
McCartney			X			
McNair			X			
Wilkes (V.Ch)			X			

Vote on Memorialization on November 3, 2021:

BOARD MEMBER	MOTION	SECOND	AYE	NAY	ABSTAIN	ABSENT
Bagoff (Ch.)						
Guarino						
Smeraldo						
Klein					X	
McCartney						
McNair						
Morgan						
Wilkes (V.Ch)						

Certified to be a true copy of the Resolution adopted on the 3rd day of November 2021.

Diana L. Chandler, Acting Secretary

EXHIBIT A

<https://www.westorange.org/1790/Landmark-Designation-Reports>