

RESOLUTION
of the
PLANNING BOARD OF THE TOWNSHIP OF WEST ORANGE

Heard: October 6, 2021, and April 6, 2022

Adopted: May 4, 2022

Township of West Orange Historic Preservation Commission Presentation: Proposed
Designation of Certain Properties as Historic Landmarks

WHEREAS, pursuant to the New Jersey Municipal Land Use Law (MLUL) N.J.S.A. Section 40:55D-109 and Section 25-30 of the Revised Ordinances of the Township of West Orange, the Township of West Orange Historic Preservation Commission (the "Commission") has undertaken the survey and study of certain properties within the Township of West Orange (the "Township") in order to properly identify such properties that meet the statutory criteria for designation as a Historic Landmark; and

WHEREAS, following the statutory procedure provided in Revised General Ordinances, Section 25-30 as well as the above-cited Section of the MLUL, the Commission retained the services of Hunter Research, Inc. and Eryn Boyce, M.S. Architectural Historian and Patrick Harshbarger, M.A., M.P.A., Principal Historian/Architectural Historian who conducted in-depth studies and research reports, (the "Report") (Enclosed Hereto as EXHIBIT A) on the George V. Hecker Carriage House, 36 Ridge Road (the "Subject Property"); and

WHEREAS, copies of the Report were posted on the Township website, and printed copies were placed in the West Orange Public Library. To seek public input regarding the Commission's intention to nominate this property as a Local Historic Landmark, the Report was presented to the public at a properly noticed virtual meeting on July 21, 2021; and

WHEREAS, at the conclusion of the Historic Preservation Commission's July 21, 2021 public meeting, Members of the Commission considered the contents of the Report and then voted to support the Report's conclusions as to the designation of four of five Subject Properties as Historic Landmarks according to the statutory criteria and to send the recommendations and conclusions forward to the Planning Board for its consideration; and

WHEREAS, at its properly noticed Regular Meeting held on October 6, 2021, the Planning Board reviewed and considered the Report and heard sworn testimony from Brian Feeney and Martin Feitlowitz, the Chair and Vice-Chair of the Historic Preservation Commission; and

WHEREAS, the Board also heard sworn testimony from the primary author of the Report, Patrick Harshbarger, M.A., M.P.A., Principal Historian/Architectural Historian; and

WHEREAS, the Board having approved four of the five properties presented, and having taken testimony and comments from members of the public, the Board having tabled the remaining application, the George V. Hecker Carriage House, 36 Ridge Road, Block 80.05/Lot 40.02 due to pending litigation; and

WHEREAS, at its properly noticed Regular Meeting held on April 6, 2022, the Planning Board having been advised that the pending litigation regarding the George V. Hecker Carriage House was settled moved to place the matter for the Board's consideration; and

WHEREAS, the proofs having been placed on the record at the full hearing that took place on October 6, 2021, respect to the George V. Hecker Carriage House, 36 Ridge Road with all Board members having participated in the hearing or having read/listened to the full transcript of the October 6, 2021 hearing; and

WHEREAS, the Board considered the opinions of its professional staff and also provided for public comment on the Report at the hearing of October 6, 2021; and

WHEREAS, having heard the presentations and having performed its review pursuant to N.J.S.A. Section 40:55D-109 and Section 25-30 of the Revised Ordinances of the Township of West Orange, the Board hereby makes the following findings of fact and conclusions of law:

1. The Board accepted into evidence the following Documents:

<u>SUBMISSION ITEM</u>	<u>SIGNED BY</u>	<u>DATE/REVISION</u>
Memorandum	Brian Feeney, Chair, Township of West Orange Historic Preservation Commission	9/27/2021
PowerPoint Slide Presentation	Hunter Research, Patrick Harshbarger, M.A., M.P.A., Principal Historian/Architectural Historian	October 2021
Reports(s)	Hunter Research, Patrick Harshbarger, M.A., M.P.A., Principal Historian/Architectural Historian & Eryn Boyce, M.S. Architectural Historian	October 2019, September- November, 2019; November 2020

2. Patrick Harshbarger, M.A., M.P.A., Principal Historian/Architectural, Hunter Research, presented the findings and conclusions of the Report to the Board and also presented the above-referenced PowerPoint presentation to the Board which summarized the Report's findings and provided pictographic evidence with respect to the Subject Properties.

3. The 2010 Master Plan Update lists the following General Objective: "Promote the Preservation of Historic Structures and Places". As noted on Page 9 of the Township of West Orange 2019 Master Plan Update, this General Objective remains valid.
4. West Orange is home to a number of historic buildings and properties, with a rich heritage including historical figures and notable events. The Township's history is preserved through local landmarks and documented in the local history collection housed in the West Orange Public Library. The West Orange Historic Preservation Commission plays a key role in these efforts through actions such as reviewing applications for development impacting historic landmarks and updating the Township's survey of historic resources, through funding provided by the State.
5. Page 44 of the 2019 Master Plan update features the following recommendations:
 - The Historic Preservation Commission should be better promoted within the Township.
 - Consider designating additional local landmarks.
 - Continue updating the survey of historic resources, as it needs to be updated regularly for West Orange to remain a Certified Local Government, which impacts eligibility for funding from the State.
 - Emphasize the sustainability and community character benefits of reuse of historic and other older buildings.
6. The definitions and procedures for local designation of historic landmarks and districts in the Township of West Orange are contained in Chapter 25-30 of the township's ordinances. Specifically, the National Register Criteria for designation are incorporated by reference in subsection 25-30.3(b).³⁵ The National Register Criteria for eligibility are described by the U.S. Department of the Interior, National Register Program in 36 CFR

60.4: “The quality of significance in American history, architecture, archaeology, engineering, and culture is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures and objects that possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association, and: A. that are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or B. that are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or C. that embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or D. that have yielded, or may be likely to yield information important in prehistory or history.

7. During a historic sites survey of the Township of West Orange completed in 1991- 1992, the George V. Hecker Carriage House at 36 Ridge Road (Block 80.05, Lot 40.02) was identified as an excellent example of Stick-style architecture and for its association with the historic Mountain Ridge neighborhood. Per the Township of West Orange Revised General Ordinances 25-30.3, “Historic District and Landmark Designation,” the West Orange Historic Preservation Commission retained the services of Hunter Research, Inc. in 2020 to conduct an indepth study of the George V. Hecker Carriage House and its history with the goal of designating it as a Local Historic Landmark. This Landmark Designation Report presents the results of this study and was prepared to support the West Orange Historic Preservation Commission’s recommendation that the Master Plan and Zoning Map of the Township of West Orange be amended to designate the George V. Hecker Carriage House as a Local Historic Landmark. This is the first step in the local

landmark designation process outlined by Township of West Orange Revised General Ordinances 25-30.3.

8. During the meeting of October 6, 2021, the Board was informed by the Township's Zoning Official that the Township has issued a Summons to the property owner of the George V. Hecker Carriage House at 36 Ridge Road (Block 80.05, Lot 40.02) related to the maintenance of the exterior of the structure and therefore tabled the vote until such time as the issues related to the summons could be resolved.
9. At the meeting of April 6, 2022, the Board was advised that the issues related to the maintenance of the exterior of the structure that was the subject of the Summons were resolved.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE PLANNING BOARD OF THE TOWNSHIP OF WEST ORANGE that the Board finds that the George V. Hecker Carriage House at 36 Ridge Road (Block 80.5, Lot 40.02) meets the above-described statutory criteria for designation as Historic Landmarks pursuant to N.J.S.A. Section 40:55D-109 and the National Register Criteria for designation as incorporated by reference in subsection 25-30.3(b).35 of the Revised Ordinances of the Township of West Orange.

Diana L. Chandler, Acting Board Secretary

Vote Action Taken by the Board on April 6, 2022:

Board Member	Motion	Second	Aye	Nay	Abstain	Absent
K. Alper			Y			
J. Cardoza			Y			
J. Guarino		x	Y			
L. Klein						-----
S. McCartney			Y			
J. McNair			Y			
C. Morgan			Y			
P. Smeraldo			Y			
W. Wilkes						-----
S. Jensen			Y			
R. Bagoff	x		Y			

Vote on Memorialization May 4, 2022:

Board Member	Motion	Second	Aye	Nay	Abstain	Absent
K. Alper						
J. Cardoza						
J. Guarino						
L. Klein						
S. McCartney						-----
J. McNair						
C. Morgan						
P. Smeraldo						
W. Wilkes						
S. Jensen						
R. Bagoff						